

**Contemporary Female Activism: Female Activists and Social
Movements in the Cyber-Era**

By: Melody Ng

Thesis Advisor: Michael Musheno

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am forever thankful for the assistance that was given to me by various people on this paper. First of all, thanks to my thesis advisor, Michael Musheno, first for his input and his guidance throughout the entirety of the paper—from project conception to final execution— and, second, for the enthusiasm that often buoyed the process of my research and writing when I had doubts or concerns about the paper’s direction. Second, thanks to Jamie Rowen, whose advice has helped me refine as well as enrich the results of this paper. Finally, thanks to Jessie Silva and I-Wei Wang for your help in directing me to illuminating resources that have allowed for this paper to become what it has become.

ABSTRACT

Popular media depictions of the female activists that participated in the Arab Spring characterize their involvement in the revolutions as extraordinary, because they, as women, are typically confined to the “private” sphere, and activism is a decidedly “public” activity. This paper explores how gender-identity and social media intersect in the young female social media activists by focusing on: 1) how gender-identity is expressed in their choice or resistance tactics, 2) what the expressive content in blogs reveal about their understanding their involvement as female activists in social movements, and 3) how the use of social media in social movements challenges existing understandings of female activists and their place in the public/private spheres. It will also consider how the advent of social media as a social/political resistance tactic should factor into how we characterize female activism (whether it challenges notions of female in the long-standing public and private binary) and how contemporary female activists envision their own role in social movements. I suggest that discursive media has been long used by women activists in social movements and consider how the use of social networking in social movements might be a contemporary extension of this history of discursive media as social resistance. I argue, in the context of female cyber activism, that the use of the Internet as a medium to conduct social resistance disrupts the traditional boundaries between “private” and “public.” Ultimately, my findings challenge the characterizations of contemporary female activists by popular media, which simplify their existences as “private” social actors stepping out of the “private” sphere into the “public.”

Table of Contents

Abstract	Pp. 2
Acknowledgements	Pp. 3
Table of Contents	Pp. 4
I. Introduction and Research Questions	Pp. 5-7
II. Literature Review	Pp. 7-16
III. Theoretical Framework	Pp. 16-17
IV. Methods	Pp. 18-26
V. Findings	Pp. 26- 50
VI. Conclusions	Pp. 50-54
VI. Appendices	Pp. 55-62
A. Progressive Era and Civil Rights Era Female Activists and Media Use	
B. Egyptian Revolution Female Blogger Profiles	
C. Occupy Movement Female Blogger Profiles	
VIII. Works Cited	Pp. 63-70

I. INTRODUCTION

On January 18th 2011, one week before January 25th, Asmaa Mahfouz posted a video online calling forth to her fellow Egyptians to speak up and voice their disapproval of President Hosni Mubarak and announcing her intentions to go to Tahrir Square to protest. The call failed, drawing only a few supporters that were quickly moved by the authorities away from the square. One week later, on January 25th, Asmaa posted another video blog in which she declared that she intended to go to Tahrir Square and challenged her fellow Egyptians to have the courage to join her and express dissent against the corrupt government and demand their rights as Egyptian citizens be upheld. Eventually, this video spawned protests in Cairo that would draw protesters by the tens of thousands.¹ Asmaa has been attributed by many media sources as being the girl who helped spark the Egyptian Revolution.

Asmaa Mahfouz is one of several women who have been featured prominently in the media as one of the women revolutionaries that helped push forward the various movements in the Arab Spring. Female activist bloggers, like Ben Mhenni, are being hailed by media everywhere for their participation and leadership in the Arab Spring movements— are the faces of the Arab Spring. Middle Eastern women cyber activists have been featured in Western media that characterizes their participation in the Arab Spring revolution as remarkable, mainly, it appears to me, because they assume that Middle Eastern women must contend with multiple forms of oppression— being women and being Middle Eastern. While there is some truth to that notion, the media seems to imply that they find the very being of Middle Eastern women activists surprising because they assume Middle Eastern women, for cultural, political, and institutional reasons, are more confined to the “private” sphere than Western women.² Therefore, the very notion of young Middle Eastern women cyber-activists defies the private/ public dichotomy that they believe has accurately categorized the women in Middle Eastern society. While, this dichotomy is emphasized in news sources reporting about the involvement of Middle Eastern women participating in the revolution, it fails to address the reality that the public/private

¹ “Equal Rights Takes to the Barricades.” The New York Times.
http://www.nytimes.com/2011/02/02/world/middleeast/02iht-letter02.html?_r=1

² “The Women Behind the Arab Spring.” The Economist.
<http://www.winnipegfreepress.com/opinion/westview/the-women-behind-the-arab-spring-131910473.html>.

“After the Revolution, Arab Women Seek More Rights.” National Public Radio.
<http://www.npr.org/2011/08/06/137482442/after-the-revolution-arab-women-seek-more-rights>

dichotomy is applied to non-Middle Eastern women as well.³

Women activists have found ways to participate in social movements even though activism is considered the domain of the “public” sphere and traditional conceptions of “the female” relegate them to the “private” sphere. Even so, women activists have long used discourse as a resistance tactic in social movements to create awareness of the causes and to create alternative discourses that challenge a common understanding of dominant institutions. The advent of the Internet in the 1990s and the development of new social media have only provided another forum for political dissent and another resistance mechanism for activists to mobilize. It has also made the once relatively local phenomenon of female activism more visible to a wider public. It is for these reasons that new social media, and the female activists utilizing it, complicate the existing private/public paradigm as it pertains to females as social actors.

Contemporary female activists are situated uniquely in an era in which cyber activism has come into great prominence and the development of social media has made visibility (a primary imperative during social movements) easier. Existing literature about women in social movements suggest that women are prone to utilizing resistance tactics that focus on communication and the spreading of information and alternative discourses. (Hooghe 2008, Taft 2011, Leonard 1998, Qian 2003, Skalli 2006, Yadav 2010, Yan 2006) Following that premise, it seems logical that social movements would value the participation of women activists who contribute to the social movement by publicizing the movement through information politics. In fact, history shows that women have been pushed to the frontlines at the start of revolutions at then early stages of the movement when it has not yet gained the notoriety that will eventually characterize its significance in history. It also shows that these same women are later pushed back to the “private” sphere once the movement gains momentum— from the Progressive Era to the Civil Rights Movement to the 2009 Iranian protests and now the Arab Spring. The same Middle Eastern women activists who are honored as revolutionaries in Western media are now vilified, post-revolution, by the men by which they stood, championing the same cause, during

³ “Egyptian Riot Grrrls.” Foreign Policy in Focus.

http://www.fpif.org/articles/egyptian_riot_grrls

“Women Are a Substantial Part of Egyptian Protests.” Slate.

http://www.slate.com/blogs/xx_factor/2011/01/27/egyptian_protests_women_are_a_substantial_part.html

“Revolution, Women And Social Media in The Middle East.” The Huffington Post.

http://www.huffingtonpost.com/courtney-c-radsch/revolution-women_b_1235603.html

the protests.

My study sheds light on how contemporary young women activists perform gender-identity in their activism by analyzing their blogs to see what they reveal about how they understand their role as female activists in larger social movements. My study also considers horizontally the use of social media by women activists from past eras, including the Progressive Era, the Civil Rights movement (through studies and biographies) and, more recently, the Occupy Bay Area movements, in order to see how female activists' understanding of how they fit into the public/private dynamic characterizing female activism has changed, if it has changed, over time. Ultimately, I want my study to 1) offer a more nuanced understanding of the roles of contemporary female activists in the cyber era than have been given by explanations currently offered by popular media sources, newspapers, and in some scholarly works which essentialize the gender in female activism by framing female social action within a public/private paradigm without considering how the advent of social media changes that paradigm, and 2) examine how or whether female activists internalize this change in the expressive content that they publish.

My thesis thus consider the following questions in order to explore how contemporary female activists 1) perform gender and 2) conceive of the public and private domains in the context of social movements: How is gender-identity expressed by contemporary young women cyber activists in their blogs? What do the expressive content in the blogs of young women activists reveal about how they understand their activities and their place as female activists within social movements? How does the use of social media itself as a medium of social resistance in social movements challenge existing understandings of female activism and their place in the public and private sphere? How does contemporary female activists' use of social media in social movements compare/contrast with the use of social media in social movements by female activists in the past?

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The small body of literature there is about contemporary young women activism does not speak directly about female activism and gender-identity, but to related issues, such as legal consciousness in politically active females (Duncan 1999, Gordon 2008, Hooghe 2008, Tobin and Hanrie 2010). However, there are a few emerging studies that focus on how female gender-identity is expressed/performed in contemporary social movements. I aim to explore how female

gender-identity is expressed by young women activists in contemporary social movements and how their understanding of their role in social movements as females and as activists challenges existing notions/assumptions about women activists and female political participation as falling within a public/private paradigm. Since my study considers the use of social media as a social resistance tactic by young women activists in social movements including the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy movement (Bay Area), I look to the expressive content published by the activists through new social media, and, for historical context, at scholarly studies and biographies about women activists during the Civil Rights and Progressive Eras, in order to ground my research.

Identity

Females and Legal Consciousness

Much of the literature about the relationship between gender, legal consciousness, and mobilization has attributed female gender-identity to particular resistance tactics (social networking, informal social gatherings).⁴ The literature alludes to the notion that female activism is a distinct contradiction in terms because it is assumed that female activists themselves believe in and conform to the private/public paradigm that is used to characterize their activity. However, Taft, in her study of young female activists, finds that young female activists are able to successfully negotiate the conflicting roles that are embedded within the identity of the “girl activist” (2011). Female activists’ identity as “female” complicates, enforces, and informs their tactics as advocates for social change (e.g. their cultivation of personal relationships and communication maps onto the structural (horizontal/non-hierarchical, versus vertical/hierarchical) organization of the movements to which they belong). It seems problematic that the female activists studied, and the scholars that study them, make essentialist claims about how their identity as females correlates with social organizing tactics that are more oriented to increasing civil participation rather than direct political action in social movements (Taft 2011, Tobin and Hanrie 2010). However, the literature suggests that female activists, while accepting these gender-essentialist explanations, are able simultaneously to subvert these essentialist notions by expanding the notion of “female” in conjunction with “activist” (Taft 2011).

⁴ Gilligan proposes women are more predisposed to value selflessness, social responsibility, and social relationships and communication, which are actualized in how they function in everyday life (1993).

Discourse

Legal Consciousness and Narratives: Expressive Content and Subtle Activism

I make claim that and investigate whether blogs are to the young women activists who use them to advance their goals as reactionary newspapers, counter-culture magazines, and other written material that were produced by women in earlier eras were to their causes. Based on this claim, I use the body of literature that proposes that oppositional consciousness—a or an individual’s consciousness of their disadvantaged place in a dominant institution— is expressed 1) through the choice of social resistance action (using social media to creating alternative discourses or direct political action) and 2) in the expressive content of those social media venues— how they frame political dissent against institutions and their role in that the institution as it is.

Scholars have explored how social conditions produce "hegemonic tales" and propose that these narratives are “social acts that are produced by norms of performance and can reveal challenges to hegemony and reveal connections between social organizations and individual lives.” (Ewick and Silbey 1995) Likewise, they argue that tales of resistance “become part of a stream of socio-cultural knowledge about how social structures work to distribute power and disadvantage.” Drawing upon Ewick and Silbey’s work, I analyze how female bloggers situate themselves in larger society and within the social movement through the narratives they tell (expressive content) and the mediums through which they narrate the story (blogs). Assuming that the female activists I studied live within institutions that repress them in some way by seeking to reduce their mobility and visibility in the public sphere, I believe that examining how female bloggers construct their identity by analyzing the stories they tell about themselves and their fellow citizens, and how they believe they are situated in the social movement on their blogs will lead to a better understanding of how gender-identity may be reflected in in their choice of resistance tactics.

Female Participation in Social Movements: Mobilization through Discourse

By researching the literature on women’s participation in social movements spanning various countries, I hope to lay down a historical framework that deconstructs, or at least offers a more nuanced explanation of, the culturally essentialist and generally Western notions that

female activism in the Middle East is something that novel and revolutionary within conservative, theocratic countries. It is possible that their involvement in the revolution is surprising because women activists in the Middle East are, mistakenly, presumed to be governed, even more so than “Western” women activists, by the public/private framework that has been used to define women and social action in public life. I consider how they and all contemporary women bloggers might fit into a long history of female activism flourishing in social environments that place considerable obstacles to female action in the public sphere. Women have always participated politically and civically in society, using alternative strategies manifesting from and expressing their rights consciousness, even if the means were less visible in dominant historical accounts, even if the venues were less politically overt.⁵

Much of the literature explores the contradiction of the female as a social actor, since females typically have been associated with the private sphere and women activists have a very public existence. Various studies find links between females’ legal consciousness to their levels of activism.⁶ While these studies focus on “un-actualized” legal consciousness in females (that which is not translated into public political action) others focused the nuanced ways through which females have asserted their rights in ordinary, perhaps, more “private” spaces. While there is ambivalence about whether the dichotomy within the female activist is ultimately empowering, there is a consensus that the “female activist” is a salient figure that does not have to be blatantly dissident to effect social change. In China, women utilized the written word as a form of political dissent in the 1898 Reform Movement against Manchurian occupation and again, during the Japanese occupation in World War II, to voice opposition against the institution while operating within it (Qian 2003, Smith 2004). More recently in the 1990s, the popularization of cyberspace has brought forth new public, yet private, terrain for Iranian women to express political dissent and to legally mobilize (Ghorashi 2006).

These findings about females and ordinary resistance suggest that in the face of a technologically progressive world and a body of literature that argues politics is in virtually

⁵ Yan 2006, Dwyer 1998, Elshtain 1981.

⁶ Some studies suggest that higher levels of legal consciousness and anti-authoritarianism are directly proportional to higher levels of political activity, while others find that there is a discontinuity between girls’ stated ideals and actual political action which manifests as a result of the gendered way in which they process conflict with parental power (Duncan 1999, Gordon 2008). Likewise, some studies about female political participation reveal that girls often reported a higher level of intended political participation than which actually manifested in political participation in their adults lives, were reported to favor less confrontational and radical approaches than boys, and are less likely to classify themselves “political” (Hooghe 2008, Tobin and Hanrie 2010).

every choice that social actors make (Sarat 1993), the public-private dichotomy that has been ascribed to female social action oversimplifies female participation in social movements. The female activist blogger, who exists at once in both the private and public realm, complicates the public-private framework that has been used to characterize female political participation. Blogs have a private and public dimension to them, and can purposefully or inadvertently express the female bloggers' private and personal beliefs, even while serving a very public and political purpose—to inform and to mobilize that awareness socially and politically.

New Social Media and Legal Mobilization: Disrupting Public and Private Boundaries

Alternative discursive media (pamphlets, books, magazines, or radio programs) have long been used by participants in social movements for the purposes of publicity and to challenge dominant views espoused by the institution they seek to change. For example, zines (“self-published independent texts devoted to various topics”), which were popularized in the 1970s, constituted an alternative discourse venue utilized by the females of the 1990s “riot grrl” movement (Leonard 1998). The written word has always functioned as a crucial instrument for revolutions and, with the advent of the Internet in the 1990s, it too would inevitably become another venue of mobilization through which movements could flourish. Social networking—like the various discursive mediums before it—has become a way for social groups with weak political standing to make their causes known to a larger audience (Zhang 2010).⁷

Information politics seems to be the most effective way to mobilize awareness and participants in social movements, as well as a way for women to transcend traditional public/private boundaries that restrict their participation in social movements. Scholars argue that the emergence of the Internet in the 1990s was a crucial development for Middle Eastern women that allowed them to participate in social movement from which they otherwise would have been excluded.⁸ While the use of information politics is a time-worn mobilization strategy, new social

⁷ However, Zhang also finds that the merits of social media as a resistance tactic have limits. Though social networking has been shown to increase civic participation and offers a space to increase community involvement, its use does not necessarily lead to increased political participation, because it is used primarily to maintain relationships.

⁸ “Cyberspace [...] is sometimes the only space that women living in Iran can escape to in order to express themselves freely, to collect information, to reach other, diaspora Iranians, and the rest of the world” (Ghorashi 2006). Likewise, Skalli argues that new social media has allowed Arabic women to “[shape, impact, and redefine] the public sphere despite the often-institutionalized norms of exclusion and marginalization restricting their physical mobility and visibility” and to create “alternative discursive spaces where it is possible to redefine patriarchal gender

media furthers the reach of the women so they are better able to disseminate alternative discourses that change, by challenging and/or augmenting, the dominant public discourses informing the public sphere. It is also important to note that the use of social media as a movement tactic is not historically particular only to females, but may apply to females inasmuch that they, like other social groups that have used discursive media to advance causes, belong to a more comparatively politically weak social group. Radio programs were a crucial component of social movements that promoted collective identity among US Southern textile workers and were key to their mobilizing against their employers during the late 20s to mid-30s (Roscigno 2001).⁹ I use the literature on new social media to establish my study's focus on female activist blogs as an "alternative discursive space" through which they can mobilize.

The traditional public and private divide which positions the home in the private realm and activism in the public realm has been complicated by developments in information technologies. The internet provides an outside space for women to conduct "public" activism while still technically remaining in "private." As such, traditional power relations founded upon the public/private divide are also challenged by new information technologies. McNamee argues that gendered power relations in the home are complicated by the popularization of video games, which has pulled boys back to the home, even while the home is assumed to be the domain of girls (1998). With her study in mind, I challenge the simplistic model that links information politics (as a more subdued resistance tactic) to female activism, a model that assumes that females are inherently drawn to the internet as an alternative to "real world" activism, because it is based on the assumption that the internet is an extension of the private realm. Although the computer is situated in the home, it is a window to the outside world, and in some ways, is more public and gives far more exposure to female activists than would street protesting. It is likely that the advent of social networking dissolves the gendered notion of information politics as a form of protest and the public/private dichotomy which scholars use to frame the phenomenon of female blogging in social movements.

roles while questioning the socio-cultural, economic, political, and legal institutions constraining them." (2006)

⁹ The literature suggests that blogs represent a modern development in the use of social media as resistance— in a progression of development that spans hard text, leaflets, newsletters, magazines, radio, and now social networking. Their use, while characterized by popular media sources as "typical" for women, cannot simply be designated solely to female activists as a manifestation of female gender-identity, even while I acknowledge that female activists throughout history primarily have used social media as a resistance tactic.

Power

Social Movements: Political Versus Cultural Capital

Despite the works suggesting that historically women have chosen, or resorted, to legally mobilize through less overtly political methods (Hooghe 2008, Taft 2011, Leonard 1998, Qian 2003, Skalli 2006, Yadav 2010, Yan 2006), the literature on non-politicized mobilization (Claiborn 2007, Holloway 2002, Khosravi 2008, Kostiner 2003, McCann 2004, Merry 1995, Roscignio 2001, Zhang 2010) suggests that the use of the internet as a virtual forum for political expression is not solely the extension of young female activists' political consciousness. I deduce that the use of modern social media by young female activists simply reflects their resourcefulness in making use of new technologies that were unavailable to them previously. The tactics that young women activists choose to employ (social media) might be more or less effective in forcing social change, especially since the literature suggests that the cultural power of discourse as social resistance is significant in contemporary social movements and is changing the way that social actors perceive successful social change (Kostiner 2003). All this informs my exploration of 1) how young women activists conceive of their role in a larger social movement and 2) how and whether they internalize the same institutional changes that have made social media as a resistance tactic increasingly commonplace and that give more authority to the cultural power of discourse.

Within the historical context of women's participation in social movements and a growing body of literature about the multitude of ways that underrepresented groups in society can legally mobilize, a trend emerges in the literature about social movements that challenges older arguments (Gamson 1990) that more blatantly political strategies in social movements are the most effective way of effecting social change. Likewise, McCann argues that pursuing social change through institutional means and formal law can both help and hinder social movements, emphasizing that common strategies of mobilization include a large variety of communication tactics and information distribution (2004). Literature that explores how traditionally marginalized groups realize and assert their rights show that the use of less politicized strategies for social change has been the norm, despite works suggesting that more overt tactics are ultimately the most effective way to force social change. Various studies show that youth and other underrepresented groups in society are able to redefine themselves within larger, often repressive, institutions and assert their rights through seemingly innocuous everyday practices,

including language and consumption of goods, and even through the production/consumption of cinema. Khosravi asserts that the best way to promote greater freedom and democracy in Iran, and similarly repressed countries, is to expose citizens to different ideas and encourage independent thought by granting them access to foreign cinema (2008).

Daly challenges the assumptions that only non-liberal (protesting, social networking, street marches) modes of social movements are legitimate modes of social protest in a study about (misguided Western concerns regarding) the “Islamization” of young female Egyptians activists (Daly 2010). Her argument supports the claims, made in the literature about female and social movements, that the fact that informal resistance is 1) less obviously visible makes it a more advantageous alternative to violent street protests and 2) uniquely linked to female gender-identity. However, more comprehensive consideration of whether it is gender-identity and/or larger, gender-neutral forces that are shaping the way social actors participate in social movements can be inferred from, even if it is not explicitly discussed in, the literature. There is a notable shift in emphasis from the instrumental power of law to the more dynamic cultural implications law, causes and effects, in social change as varying groups of social actors reconfigure their views about law and social change; its ability to transform assumptions that are shared by all members of society (Kostiner 2003). Likewise, Merry argues that varying forms and instances of resistance are a product of, and inform, cultural meanings and political mobilization: “to speak of isolated individual acts of resistance is to deny the social world that constructs that individual and her sphere of action.” Resistance includes social actors refusing “to fit into categories” that others have constructed but that nonetheless define them (1995).

The literature highlighting the use of discourse as a crucial component of resistance as the cultural power within social movements is emphasized supports the claim that female bloggers exercise their capabilities as social actors by revising how they are seen by the public. That there have been a number of social movements in which the participation of female activists— among them, female bloggers— has been prominently documented presents us with an opportunity to explore the changing social and cultural climate that allows for young female cyber activism to occur. That the use of blogs as a form of contemporary social resistance has become widespread challenges the notion that girl bloggers are random actors that happen to rebel in spite of oppressive environments and allows us to consider that, while there are elements of oppression in their society, unseen or unreported changes in their society and perhaps consequently in their

private lives are occurring that grant them a degree of freedom to realize their political consciousness. It is significant that the use of blogs by female activists as a social resistance tactic coincides with the development of social networking, because just as modern social media itself challenges the public/private dichotomy, so does female blogger activism.

I suggest, as Skalli argues (2006), that the use of the internet as a virtual forum for social protest is a way for female bloggers to infiltrate the public sphere and, in a gradual process, to incorporate their voices within the dominant discourses of institutions. Similarly, Claiborn emphasizes the crucial role that social networking among citizens plays in increasing government accountability in voluntary associations, by improving access to information and allowing them to better evaluate the government's leadership (2007). Holloway's reconfiguration of effective social change through social resistance takes a more extra-institutional stance (2002). He defines revolution not as "taking power" but resisting power and characterizes the revolutionary, not as a hero navigating the state's formal system to make impactful social change, but as an ordinary person rebelling in ordinary ways: "The aim of revolution is the transformation of the ordinary, everyday life and it is surely from ordinary, everyday life that revolution must arise." His views both challenge but perhaps offer a more nuanced understanding of how female bloggers situate themselves and are situated in relation to the institutions they are trying to change. Additionally, a growing body of literature about Middle Eastern female activists deconstructs certain assumptions about how they thrive despite gender-oppression and the stringencies of Islam. Yadav posits that Yemeni women activists helped bring about Islamization (contrary to what Westerners assume about their submissive role in this phenomenon) through activism—albeit gender-segmented. Their role as "dynamic actors who respond to changing discursive and institutional circumstances, just as they help to shape them" situates them in a position in which they have enough social and political weight to undermine gender segregation and push for more changes (2010). The Yemeni women activists by effecting change while situated in a "private" domain subverts preconceptions about "private" and "public" by changing what can be done within those spheres. From this literature, I draw a progression of influence starting from identity, to discourse, to power: 1) females have historically and contemporarily utilized social media as a way to create alternative discourses in social movements and 2) because of this, and a growing body of literature which emphasizes the power of cultural influence in social change and the ability of discourse to effect that cultural

influence, females have been and are increasingly important players within contemporary social movements.

III. THEORITICAL FRAMEWORK

The works that I have cited thus far center on reoccurring themes: resistance, structures of social movements, gender in context of legal consciousness and legal mobilization. What the literature appears to have in common is that it relies on a gender essentialist notion of public and private in context of gender and political activity. There is a meager body of work about how gender-identity actually informs how young female social activist participate in activism and how these activists understand their role as female activists in social movements. The literature is limited to studies that examine the relationship between gender-identity and political participation, work-place opportunities, while some studies focus on how gender power-relations play out in the home (as a political environment). My study aims to understand how gender-identity of the young female activist bloggers is expressed in the expressive content of the social media they use to participate in social movements, and how their use of online social media, and their own characterization of the social movements and their role in it, challenges and/or augments assumptions that are made about women activists and their place in the public/private sphere.

The development of social networking itself is significant, not just to social actors that can incorporate the use of advanced communication technologies in their activism (within the vacuum of social movements), but representative of how changing technologies of information transfer reflects a changing social world. It is thus possible that social actors situate themselves differently in the changing world, and changing notions of what belongs in the domain of the public and private sphere. I infer how this change is expressed by the female bloggers and how they may have internalized this change based on whether it is reflected in what they reveal in the content of their blogs- e.g. their choice to use of social media as a resistance tactic.

The framework I establish (see Diagram 1) considers how the relationship between a girl blogger's perceived gender-identity and the external influences that shape her life are revealed in the act of female blogging as well as what is expressed in the blogs. It also places in context how the findings relate to 1) the relationship between social media and its byproduct, alternative discourses, and dominant discourses and 2) the cultural power of these alternative discourses and

how they relate to institutional changes. This framework guided the coding process of my data sources for themes and the conclusions that I drew. Ultimately, studying the girl blogger in this day and age, and in light of recent current events, offers an opportunity to question that essentialist notions about milder forms of social resistance while also offering an opportunity for a more nuanced understanding of how existing notions of the private and public sphere may or may not inaccurately map onto the gender-identity of the female blogger and the act of female blogging.

Diagram 1

IDENTITY

Girl Blogger

↑ ↓

Legal Consciousness, Identity Politics, Power Dynamics

↑ ↓

Larger Society (Home, Family, School, Peers, Laws, State)

DISCOURSE

Information

↑ ↓

New Media/ Alternative Discourses (Social Networking, Blogging)

↑ ↓

Mainstream Media/ Public Discourses

POWER

Society

Civil Society: Private, Individual Perceptions/Cultural and Social power

↑ ↓

Government: Institutional/Legal Changes

IV. METHODS

My study involves understanding how gender-identity is expressed in 1) the narratives that young female activists tell and 2) the venues through which they tell their narratives. The nature of this study is interpretive, meaning that it attempts to interpret how a young woman activist's world view as an activist reflects her gender, and thus, how or whether the methods of protest (such as the use of social media or publishing magazines) that she engages is necessarily a gendered form of activism (Thacher 2006). The existing literature on female activism and females and legal consciousness suggests that females, as a historically comparatively politically disadvantaged social group, are prone to express dissent through resistance tactics that are perceived by the public and by some scholars as less overtly public, physical. The literature suggests that females are keenly aware of the social and economic restrictions inherent to their status as women in society and that what they believe they can, should, or are able to do to change undesirable social conditions is reflected in not only the types of resistance tactics they use, but what they express through those mediums.

My research further explores this link or correlation between female gender-identity and certain kinds of resistance tactics— specifically discursive media as a resistance method that aims to create alternative discourses (as a less radical form of social resistance) in an attempt to explore how a young woman activists' behavior is affected by the way she positions herself as a female in society. In order to explore my research questions, I accumulated the blogs of young women protesters active during the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy Bay Area movement. I originally intended to include blogs from the 2009 Iranian protests as well, but due to a severe censorship policy in Iran and the fact that I had limited the blogs I wanted to include to transnational bloggers who blogged in English, I was unable to find any blogs to constitute a sample set. After profiling the blogs and bloggers and coding the blog entries, I looked to literature documenting women's involvement during the Civil Rights and Progressive Eras to test my claim that social media is the next step in an evolution of discursive resistance by women throughout history and to see whether young women's production of alternative discourses through blogging had any historical analogs in women's participation during those social movements.

While I had a broad array of social movements from which I could have chosen sample groups, I chose to focus on these particular groups of women activists, because they were

participants in very prominent, critical social movements in which the causes were not solely “women’s causes”, although women’s causes may have been one of various coexisting social agendas/“minority” interests within the larger movement. Moreover, the women activists’ participation in the movements were and are widely discussed in the media which speaks to the level of visibility they were able to achieve through their efforts— maximum visibility being the motivation behind their choice to mobilize social media as a resistance tactic.

Textual Analysis

My study required analyzing and coding the blog entries of young women activists from the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy Bay Area movement in order in order to examine whether a link exists between female gender-identity and certain modes of activism. In order to understand how they position themselves in their respective social movements as young female activists, and because securing interviews with them was out of my reach for various reasons, including time constraints and limited resources, I examined the blog entries they produced during their participation in the social movement. For a blog to be included in either of the sample sets, they had to either: 1) mention being physically present at street demonstrations and/or comment about activities taking place during the physical protests or 2) have used their blogs to publicize or communicate protest activities in furtherance of the movement. The bloggers also had to be nationals of or long-term resident of the social movement’s country of origin, because long-term residents likely had a better understanding of the local contexts and issues at the root of each of the movements.

My primary sources consisted of an array of blogs written by young Egyptian women protesters and young Bay Area women, mostly from Oakland, California. For the “Arab Spring” set, I initially intended for the scope of blogs to be from various Middle Eastern countries, but my search turned up mostly Egyptian blogs with a few others from Bahrain and Beirut that were too scarce to include as a sub-sample group of their own. This may have been for the best since, at the beginning, I was keenly aware of the limits to the conclusions I could draw if I had used a varied sample of young women Arab Spring blogs, with the many cross-regional/cultural nuances and local contexts that I would have had to consider that might have affected the stories that the bloggers told. I was aware that I might not be able to account for these differences by sampling from such a varied group of bloggers across regions. My results were also affected by

the language barriers posed by my researching for blogs in countries in which English is not the national or primary language. The blog set from the Egyptian Revolution consists of those written by English-speaking young Egyptian women, which were likely geared toward a transnational audience. I address this issue later in the ‘Sample Groups’ section. I ultimately found a total of twelve viable blogs for the Arab Spring set and eight blogs for the Occupy Bay Area set. From there, I determined that I would take one to three blog entries from each blog depending on how many entries the particular blogger had written during or about the movement. The dates of the blog entries were taken primarily within the months during which the movements were at peak momentum—for the Egyptian Revolution, from January 2011 to March 2011, and for Occupy movement, October 2011 to January 2012. I also looked at entries prior to and after peak movement activity to gauge the particular blogger’s commitment to and involvement in the movement (to include in their overall profiles).

At the beginning of the coding process, I scanned the blogs for reoccurring themes I believed would relate closely to gendered activism—moments in the text where I thought that gender-identity playing a role in how the women activists protested. While I originally thought that such themes would include their roles as women, their conception of the “female,” their roles as women in conjunction with their roles as activists, how they want to be seen, the goals they hope to achieve through their activism (equality, visibility), I found that almost all the blogs did not mention these topics outright. I then changed my strategy to simply looking at what kind of topics and themes emerged naturally from the blogs and what resulted was a coding scheme that is divided amongst five reoccurring topics: movement strategy and organization (description and critiques), characterization of the movement, personal roles (description and assessments), gendered roles in movement activity, and moments that hint at a minimal conception of a public/private boundaries. Because the nature of this analysis was interpretive, I undertook the task of coding with the knowledge that there was a large opportunity for misinterpretation, especially since these texts are representations of the women activists’ views and there is a potential margin of error for misinterpretation in any interpretive work (Thacher 2006). I also had to be aware that my own history may color my conception of public/private and gender roles and be cognizant of possibly transposing my own gender paradigm(s) onto that of those expressed by the young women in the blog sets.

Ideally, I would have been able to interview the young Arab women bloggers and some

of the women Civil Rights activists still around today. However, all else considered, I do not believe that there was a more appropriate way to attempt to understand the gendered motivations behind the behaviors of the young Egyptian women activists than by studying the next best source- their narratives. Despite the hazards that the interpretation of texts presented to me as I attempted to answer the research questions, I think the one benefit this method had over my preferred method is that it limited, in a specific way, the bias that I potentially could have imposed on the data. To some extent, interviews and textual analysis both require a degree of interpretation and I think that it would have been easy to unwittingly introduce bias into the data if I had been also responsible for creating interview questions for the informants that might have inherent assumptions behind them. I think that the benefit of my reliance on textual analysis as a method, despite the other shortcomings, as opposed to interviews is that I was able to limit that aspect of data-biasing.

Sample Groups: Contemporary Female Activists

I began locating the blogs written by young Egyptian female bloggers through various internet search strategies, including, but not limited to tracing blog web addresses that might be listed on other social media venues that were used during the revolutions, like Twitter, the specialized feature for the Google search engine that allows me to search for blogs (“Google blogs”), and by searching for news articles that talked about/to prominent Arab Spring women bloggers. I also used blog aggregating websites which archived many Egyptian blogs. The most successful method by far, at least in my search for the Egyptian female blogs, ended up being to find prominently discussed bloggers in the news, and from there, to access their blogs through a simple Google search. Once on their blogs, I was able to access many other prominent and less prominent blogs they followed and/or blogs that followed them. Another strategy that yielded results was looking on Twitter lists which compiled a large number of Twitter accounts of Egyptian protesters who tweeted during the revolution— many of which were compiled by journalists or other scholars who wrote or studied or had a level of expertise on Middle Eastern studies and current events. Many of the protesters’ Twitter profiles had links to their blogs. While I also searched for existing scholarship and working papers about the Arab Spring blogging, because I thought I might be able to find credible sources that were used in those studies as data sources for my own research, I often found that a majority of these studies were

about Twitter and only a few were about blogs. They were also more descriptive, centered around data networks, and did not list specific blog URLs. The process of finding possible Twitter accounts, and from there, repeating the process I described above was time-consuming even though it yielded no results.

There were several significant factors for which I tried to control as I collected and coded the blog entries. First, I scrutinized whether and how the women activists distinguish their role in social movements as 1) activists that happen to be women in a larger social revolution or 2) women activists campaigning for women's rights. For the most part, all of the blogs fell within the first category. I say more about whether, in the particular contexts of their participation in the specific social movements, these two categories were found to be mutually exclusive in the "Findings" section. Second, I was originally concerned about how I would characterize the female authors of the blogs, because how the terms "girl" and "young women" are applied to females is not rooted in any fixed spectrum and varies with culture. I was aware that the definitions of "girl" and "young women" are socially constructed both by the female activist within their own activist mediums (web or print) and by external authorial voices (scholars, journalists, social scientists) who write about them. For this reason, I was prepared to include women activists of a wider age range than I had originally intended. Ultimately, most of the blogs that I found were authored by women whose ages ranged from early to late twenties—some of which referred to themselves as girls or women or both at the same time—so this concern was for the most part put to rest. As for how I decided upon what would constitute "participation" in the movement, what I settled on eventually became the criteria which a particular blog would have to meet before being included in my sample sets: the blogger would have to convey through her blog that she either participated by passing along relevant information about the revolution on her blog and/or physically protested in the streets. I was cognizant that there was only so much I could account for in terms of analyzing narratives cross-culturally even as I used the literature about intersectionality to guide the analysis of the blogs. To that end, I looked to some of the literature that scholars have written recently about Middle Eastern women activism to guide my interpretation of the data I collected from the Egyptian bloggers (Yadav 2010, Skalli 2006, Brenner 2011, Sakr and Mack 2002, Nawawy and Khamis 2011, Elsadda 2010).

After I had finalized sample blogs sets, I profiled each blog and blogger. The profiles

identified personal information offered by the female bloggers in “About” sections (anonymity, personas, or full disclosure), what purpose the blog served (secular/ lifestyle/ political), the level of influence that the bloggers had in the movement, and what relation the blogger had to the movement (activist, journalist, follower). Originally, I was concerned about how many blog entries I should include from each blogger for coding. I anticipated that it would vary depending on whether I was looking for breadth (as a measure of consensus in beliefs and themes among the women activists as groups) by shallowly sampling one or two entries, as opposed to depth (as a measure of consistent expression of specific women activists) by which I would include at least three entries from each blog. However, almost all of the bloggers wrote enough about movement activity that I was able to take two to three entries from each blog for textual analysis.

The issue of sample size also coincided with a related issues: 1) I faced a language barrier by choosing to focus on young Egyptian women’s blogs and 2) my findings would be limited and perhaps skewed by the fact that the conclusions that I made were from blogs written in English for a transnational audience. However, I took into consideration that this aspect of the Egyptian Revolution set had much to do with the fact that the revolution is a contemporary movement taking place during the Internet era. Thus, I allowed some speculation that the women activists in past eras, just as those from the Egyptian Revolution or Occupy movements, published social resistance media with the intent of making what was published available to the widest audience possible and that the scope of the Egyptian blogs happened to be transnational while the scope of the Progressive and Civil Rights media was national has more to do with the availability or changing scope of discursive media than through any strategic choice made by the female activists particular to those Eras. The language barrier, while serving as a control because it meant that the use of English might indicate that both groups intended to reach a transnational audience, presents other problems. There is a limit to what is translatable from Arabic into English, and some of what the Egyptian activists may have wanted to express may not have transferred accurately into English. Moreover, the English speaking Egyptian activists represent a sub-sect of Middle Eastern activists, which made it difficult to draw conclusions about contemporary Middle Eastern activists overall. While it is likely that all groups have a transnational audience in mind, it is more difficult to say with certainty that the intended audience of all Occupy activists is transnational, since their national language is English, and it is possible that some may only intend to reach a national audience— making it more difficult to

draw solid conclusions about the Egyptian Revolution and Occupy activists as a collective group of contemporary female activists. However, the fact that English is widely spoken internationally may lend credence in favor of the claim that the Occupy activists took it for granted that their blogs would reach a transnational audience.

Historical Context: Female Activists of the Past

My study aims to draw a horizontal analysis of young women activists' participation in social movements starting from women Progressive Era activists in the 1880s in America to the young Egyptian women activists that participated in the Egyptian Revolution that began in January of 2011 and the female participants from the Occupy movement in the Bay Area. By horizontal, I mean to track linearly how young female activists, as a constant social group, have participated--through the use of alternative media-- in social movements spanning the decades. Thus, my research considered scholarly works written about American women activists of the Progressive and the Civil Rights Eras that discussed mobilization and organization strategies (some of which included publishing alternative print media-- contemporary social media's historical analogue) that these female activists utilized, in order to give me firm grounding on how the medium and the era influence gendered-expression. I examined whether and/or how horizontalist organizing and discursive activism have played out in the literature describing how past women activists have engaged movement organization and mobilization, and whether that diverges from how the contemporary young women bloggers engage in movement organizing and mobilization. Though my study focused primarily on the Egyptian Revolution and Occupy blogs, I included the biographies about women activists from past social movements to provide some measure of insight into my larger question (whether gender identity is performed through resistance tactics) by giving me a temporal frame of comparison to measure how gender performance in social resistance may have changed over time.

Ideally, I would have preferred to include the Civil Rights and Progressive Era as sample groups, but time constraints prevented me from seeking out and coding primary sources from these eras. Additionally, I realized that primary sources from that era would not be a suitable analog (for textual analysis) to the blogs-- which were at once personal diaries and public forums, while the documents were produced solely for public consumption. I thus drew conclusions about the use of media by women activists in these two earlier eras with some

reservations, because I relied on other studies instead of primary source material as background for my study. However, my use of biographies about former women activists of those eras might also be considered primary sources in themselves-- the scholarly articles and biographies function as primary sources from which I observe how the form and use of media by women activists has evolved. While the studies allowed me to observe how discursive activism as a resistance tactic functioned in those eras (framework: Discourse to Power), I could not track how the gender-identity of the past female activists was expressed or changed (in the absence of primary sources) (framework: Identity to Discourse). While I still was able to draw tentative conclusions to this strand of inquiry by looking to scholarly studies about the social media use by women activists in past eras, I could have drawn more solid conclusions if I had been able to test this proposition by using primary sources.

Using Social Movement Literature to Frame Young Women Social Media Activism

The secondary component of my study placed my findings about gender-identity's link to activism from the analysis of the young women bloggers in context of the past and current literature about social movement theory. This section of my study considered whether my findings 1) either confirm or contest existing older theories about the presumed advantage that more politically radical forms of protest have over mellower forms of resistance such as the cultivation of alternative discourses (blogs, magazines, "zines") and/or 2) whether they align with the emerging body of literature that places more emphasis on the role that "everyday" resistance has played throughout history (peasant rebellions, women's movements, secret political colonial dissidents operating within their occupied nations) and the role it may be playing in contemporary social movements. The findings about the (discursive) tactics emphasized by the female bloggers are augmented by the general arguments about social movement theory that I found in the literature.

Horizontalist organizing, which has been a mode historically associated with women, like the grassroots organizing of the women activists of the Progressive and Civil Rights Eras and now the use of social media by the Egyptian women bloggers, includes a variety of non-hierarchal strategies which include mobilization of the masses through discursive strategies. Using the social movement theory literature, I considered what implications arise from how young women activists identify their involvement and preferences for specific tactics in social

movements (e.g. leaderless and non-hierarchical movement organization) as well as what whether the literature provides insight about what factors (public/private boundaries changing, what constitutes the “political”) that have changed overtime may be informing the female bloggers’ preferences. This involves placing the phenomenon of horizontalist organizing in the context of the social movement theory literature’s treatment of how what constitutes political and social movement activity may have changed over time.¹⁰ Augmented by the social movement literature, I hope my findings offer a more nuanced understanding of how female activism and social movement organization operate within the realm of social movements in general. To help conceptualize this section of my research, I drew on recently published literature about the political involvement of Middle Eastern women (Yadav 2010, Skalli 2006, Brenner 2011) in social activism and longer-standing literature about social movement theory (Gamson 1975, Merry 1995, Edleman 2001, McCann 2004).

V. FINDINGS

Historical Comparison: The Progressive and Civil Rights Eras

Discursive Activism: Female Activists Utilizing Media throughout the Ages

Historically women have chosen to legally mobilize through less overtly political methods-- often through the use of alternative discourse strategies (Hooghe 2008, Taft 2011, Leonard 1998, Qian 2003, Skalli 2006, Yadav 2010, Yan 2006). While the examples of print-media and alternative press used by women activists from the Progressive Era and Civil Rights Movement differed from the use of blogs by the female Egyptian Revolution and Occupy protesters—in the sense that they were less likely to be “public/private” in nature like the female blogs which are both public forums and diaries to some of the bloggers—it is still illuminating to observe how past women activists used alternative media within larger social movements and consider how we might be able to draw a horizontal analysis of female activists’ use of alternative discursive media. It is also important to consider that there may be no perfect historical analog for the female blogs simply due to the fact that blogs are borne of the age of social media, and the internet may have changed how the female activists themselves conceive of

¹⁰ What I mean by that is that social networking qualifies both as a horizontalist (fairly non-hierarchical) mode of social organizing and, perhaps more so than other types of social media of the past, has a very public and private character—to the extent that the young Arab women bloggers 1) are probably more likely to express their feelings (because blogging offers a kind of privacy which enables them to be more forthright about their opinions) and yet 2)

“public and private” or the “public and private” boundary itself.

With the very small samples I derived from several biographies and books that compiled biobibliographies documenting individual women activists’ activities during the movements, I found, as I hypothesized, that alternative media use has been a long standing tradition for female activists within social movements and thus is not a new development despite how mainstream media has characterized female involvement in the Arab Spring. Many of the female activists who drew on personal accounts of their movement activity noted how they were themselves recruited or drawn to the movements through information they received by reading alternative press/literature, how their female activist colleagues and mentors published poetry, wrote plays and books revolving around social issues central to the movement (Ransby 2000, Houck and Dixon 2009, Wedin 1998, Brown 2008, King 2010). Many of the female activists were themselves poets, journalists and authors writing for larger publications as well as alternative presses, and even playwrights documenting and spreading awareness about various issues including Native American, African American, women, children’s rights and civil, political and economic rights in general through their works (Hardy 1993). Some activists started their own publications or publishing companies in their crusade against social injustices such as gender discrimination, segregation, and racial violence. Women’s rights activists like Casey Hayden, urged women to “tell their stories of oppression, exclusion, and condescension, and to transform the personal into the political” (Houck and Dixon 2009).

There were understandable differences between the sets of the past and present female activists. The biographies of the female activists in the past era consist mainly of prominent activists and movement leaders, while the blog sets contain a mix of prominent movement leaders and lower-level movement participants. Moreover, at least within the samples I gathered, between the past and present activists, the intended audience of their protest discourses varied slightly between the two sets. The blogger activists spoke solely to their readers—the larger public— and likely other movement activists in their informal blog networks, while the print-media activists spoke to other activists, the public, and likely formal political actors as well-- their publishing efforts were combined with campaigns on political and legal levels (Ransby 2000).

have broader accessibility to the public and a wider audience to which they can distribute information.

Rethinking Social Media as a Gendered Tactical Orientation: Contemporary Female Activist Street Presence

While it appears that the women activists of the Progressive Era were confined to participating in the movements through print-press activism, the blog sets and even some of the biographies about the Civil Rights women activists, document many instances of active female street presence in the movements. Almost all the bloggers from both sets participated both online and in street demonstrations within their respective movements. While there is evidence of an overwhelming level of female activist participation in the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy movement, the biographies of some of the female activists from the Civil Rights Movement indicate that some of them were, like the female activists from the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy movement, involved in both rallies and demonstrations as well as journalists, writers and publishers publishing materials advocating for civil rights. The fact that there is more involvement by female activists in the street demonstrations within social movements as the decades progress might correspond to how 1) public and private boundaries have changed and 2) the correlating collapse of boundaries between civil society and political and governmental institutions of the state.¹¹ What is within the bounds of gender propriety and what constitutes not only appropriate but even effective political action for social change has altered in such a way that 1) female activists are more likely to participate in public street demonstrations with less disapproval and 2) actions previously seen as “personal” and within the realm of the “cultural” (like writing subversive plays with race and gender themes at their forefront) are now considered “political” action as well. A few of the past women activists indicated that they were more cognizant of public/private boundaries than the contemporary female activists, like Elaine DeLott Baker, of the Southern Freedom Movement, reveals that she “struggled to speak [her] mind” and struggled with “the discomfort of speaking in a public forum” (Ransby 2000). She nonetheless partook of the discursive strategies of the movement while also participating in demonstrations-- such as the racially integrated bus rides. The female bloggers within these sets, and some of the females from the Civil Rights movement, appear to be more dynamic in their involvement in their respective social movements than what we know about female activists from earlier periods, like the Progressive Era.

¹¹ Higher levels of individualistic legal activity of individuals correlate with states in which there is a lack of definite boundaries between the formal government and the voluntary social relationships/institutions that make up

In regards to movement organization, there is some indication that, like the contemporary female bloggers, past women activists like civil rights activist Ella Baker were similarly “suspicious of leader-centered approaches to civil rights” and “favored grassroots model of vigorous and active local participation” (Houck and Dixon 2009). Other scholars note that women in the Civil Rights movement were designated the crucial responsibilities of organizing the movement, which were more “backstage” in nature, while leadership positions, which were more public, were open only to male activists (Ling and Monteith 2004). The blogs feature a large amount of positive commentary on the “leaderlessness” of the movements, but there is no discussion as to whether they as female protesters have either been designated or taken upon themselves the duty of organizing and mobilizing the movement, though there is consensus among them that they as movement participants— not “female participants”— must mobilize public sentiment for the movements through their blogs. It is equally as plausible that the male bloggers from these two movements view themselves and their blogs as organizing mechanisms for the movement as well.

Lastly, many of the print-media activists of these two earlier eras, at least within the sample, were more likely to identify with a cause exclusive to women or a particular minority group (the women’s movement, the African American movement, etc.) as opposed to the Civil Rights Movement in general, though that may speak to the nature of the Progressive and Civil Rights Movement compared to the Egyptian Revolution and Occupy movement. Within the Progressive and Civil Rights Movement, there were different interest groups advocating for particular goals and causes (children’s welfare, women’s rights, racial integration) but who likely believed they operated under the banner of a larger conceptual “civil rights movement,” whereas the Egyptian Revolution and Occupy movement are each centered exclusively around a single cause (class equality and democratic governance) with a few relevant cohesive goals.

Gender Identity

I realized that it would be difficult to make any conclusions about “gender identity” strictly on the basis of a conception of a distinct female voice that might emphasize certain aspects of the movement that might be unique attributed to females, because it would be far too subjective without a male blog set with which to compare. I then decided to look for instances of

gender performance revealing how the female bloggers positioned themselves in regards to “public” and “private” realms, but found little discussion in the blogs. I ultimately decided that I would consider how “gender identity” and “performance” are implied to varying degrees in two categories raised in the blogs: A) “gendered issues” (such as women as a minority in the group, gendered motivations for participation, and sexual harassment in the streets) and B) “tactics” (methods of movement participation including social media and/or street demonstration). I considered these two categories collectively to determine how and whether gender was performed by the bloggers in the movement.

A. Issues: “our brothers and sisters”... “now is not the time for you to speak out”

Bloggers from both set seemed to identify either as nationals or comrades in their respective movements more so than as “female activists” in the movement. Many of the Egyptian bloggers forwent gendered pronouns and spoke about the protesters in very nationalistic terms: they addressed themselves and their protesters as “Egyptians” and “brothers and sisters” and invoked themes of sacrifice and martyrdom. It seemed to me that the bloggers were at least cognizant of how gender roles were put aside in the name of the national spirit and to preserve a collective unity that brought all the protesters together in Tahrir Square: young, old, male, female, urban, and rural. Moreover, the female bloggers displayed no sense of conflict in their simultaneously defining the movement as a national collective movement in which differences did not matter while still noting the different roles men and women sometimes played on the ground. Similarly, the Occupy bloggers noted how the movement encouraged a sense of community that triumphed over differences (Love, Health and Advocacy, 11/1/2011): *“It has encouraged people of all races, gender and economic status (within the 99% and even the 1% (Micheal Moore..Danny Glover?) to come together and speak out about equity and it has visibly shifted the political discourse.”*

Bloggers from both sets characterized the movements as inclusive communities where differences were unimportant—even though those differences would remerge later as tensions related to advancing the movement through collective actions along with competing agendas. There is slight indication that differences (including gender) were pushed back during both the movements though the minority interests, including women’s rights, were perceived by the minorities and women as implicit concern to the movements. The protesters may have simply

assumed that any movement that based its claim on absolute liberation of individuals from an oppressive class or political system would have to concern itself with minority interests because these interests and the well-being of these minority groups are intrinsically tied to the political and class oppressions at issue in the movements. In an entry (5/17/2011) from Leila Zahra-Mortada's blog, consisting of interviews with women protesters from the Egyptian Revolution, one of the protesters revealed how minority groups (women, gay and lesbian rights, etc.) felt in the larger movement: "*now is not the time for you to speak out.*" Almost all the blog entries had all characterized the movement as a national one with a "greater cause" at its center, and the female protesters interviewed for Leila Zahra-Mortada's blog asserted that minority demands became distinguished from the goals of the larger movement when they had assumed earlier in the revolution that they all had, and still do have, a vested interest in pursuing more democratic governance. Similarly, Eiko Huh wrote on 1/18/2012 about the "*infighting*" occurring within the Occupy Oakland movement: "*the fighting about focusing on certain issues needs to stop, saying that Occupy Oakland and Occupy Wall Street are separate needs to stop [...] diversity of tactics being a problem needs to stop and the conversation about the diversity of tactics being the solution needs to be the more popular one*"

B. Movement Tactics and Organization

1. Discursive activism: "most importantly...BE HEARD!"... "the power of the word"

Almost all of the Egyptian bloggers emphasized that the revolution began and maintained itself through the use of social media--revealed through personal accounts of how they shared and received information about the street protests and marking moments when the government retaliated against the movement by shutting down communication (Internet, phones, etc.). Both the Egyptian and Bay Area bloggers used their blogs to discuss strategy and begin an open discourse about why the protests were happening, to identify goals and problems within the movement, to educate others by using their blogs as forums, and to organize and mobilize. Many of the blog entries which discussed the importance of the media and its effect on public opinion and open and reflective discourse suggest that blogging is a vital way to participate in the movement by cultivating public awareness. A few bloggers suggested that cultivating public opinion through discourse was a necessary step to provide the foundation necessary to pursue changes at a formal institutional level. Eiko Huh writes on 11/13/2011: "*the movement is not*

ready to begin real bureaucratic actions as of yet.... Because the General Assembly is the way to truly address the 99%, we need more people in the community (each community) to become more involved. We need everyone's opinion...” Likewise, Love Health and Advocacy wrote on 11/1/2011: *“We can’t solve these problems with one single law, or action. [...]Yet, what can happen is that our voices can be heard and for the ‘powerful’ to realize that they can not continue with business as usual[...] We can boycott, sit-in, march, vote, shout, dance .. but most importantly..BE HEARD!”*

It can be inferred that the bloggers’ use of personal narratives functions as publicity to mobilize more individuals to participate in the movement, or, as some of them mentioned, to ensure that the movement remains on the minds of fellow protesters and anyone else who is reading-- making an impression on public opinion and maintaining the sense that the revolution is necessary. Nermeena reveals that discursive activism and social movements is a part of Egypt’s national history in an entry on 4/5/2011, in which she offers a brief history of Egyptian poets as revolutionaries. She brings attention to the *“secret love triangle between the poets, people, and revolutions”* and connects this history to social media activism— rousing people with *“the power of the word”*— of the present day. Along with supporting the consensus among the female bloggers that discourse and social media matter in social movements, Nermeena’s account destabilizes the notion that social media is somehow a more “feminine” mode of movement participation by placing it in context of Egypt’s national history. Discursive media is a dissident’s instrument-- a national rather than gendered practice.

Some scholars consider the internet as a kind of “public sphere” that females might be prevented from accessing for that very reason that it is “public” in a sense, so it may be more accurate to say political blogging itself defies female gender roles (females protesting within a male-dominated medium (Wilson and Dunn 2011)) (McNamee 1998). However, none of the bloggers stated that they personally felt this way. In fact, the claim that political blogging itself is “masculine” and defies female gender roles is complicated by the nature of the blogs that I found, because 1) the blogs were a fusion of “diary” and “political forum” and 2) some bloggers were forthright about not considering themselves activists even though their blogs became political forums after their induction into revolutionary media activism.

2. On and Off-line: “cover the battle from my home with laptop”... “in overalls is leading the

chants”

Within the blogs, I scanned for gender performance in two fields: 1) in the street protests and 2) in blogging itself. I found that traditional gender roles were both affirmed and defied on the streets, and though I searched for moments of meta-awareness in which the bloggers discussed the advantages and/or setbacks of blogging as revolutionary activity to determine whether there were any gendered implications, I found no such explicit discussions. From what I gathered, both men and women seemed as likely to use social media and physically protest, though some women discussed being more wary about the physical dangers of the street protests. Some bloggers, like One Long Road, lamented that the physical dangers of the streets led them on some occasions to blog about the revolution instead, which they implied was the next best option to actually being on the streets. However, no bloggers, either explicitly or implicitly, suggested that it was their gender that forced them to turn to social media to participate in the movement. Male and female protesters both risked injury by choosing to participate in the street demonstrations.

I found that almost all of the female bloggers were just as active in the streets as they were in advancing communication about the movement through their blogs. Some of the bloggers were even more active on the streets than on their blogs (as deduced from the high Twitter activity consisting of moment-to-moment updates about what was happening in Tahrir Square that I observed). While some of the blog entries contained more logistical information about demonstrations or movement organization, most of the entries were first-hand accounts of their experiences--either in the middle of the chaos or standing slightly afar-- of the street demonstrations in Tahrir Square. This finding suggests that the assumption made about social media being a more “female” form of resistance, at least in the context of the Egyptian revolution and Occupy movement, is a gross mischaracterization of the female activists as a group. I am, however, fully aware that my sample set consists of female bloggers speaking to a transnational audience, and thus who may have been raised with more access to education, more exposure to diverse ideas, and with more freedom of mobility than other females, that may have prompted them to be more willing to violate certain notions of gender propriety and public/private boundaries. While this finding deconstructs the portrait of the female revolutionary as a protester sitting safely behind a computer screen-- and the notion that she somehow transgresses a strict public/private boundary-- it does not reveal much about whether

the use of social media itself is gendered. As far as I can tell by looking at the female bloggers' "About" sections and from what a few of the bloggers stated about why they blog in the first place, none of the bloggers claim that they use social media because they feel restricted in their everyday lives. That is not to say that it is not possible that they are not more forthcoming about certain social/political issues on their blogs than they might be if they were talking about these same issues out on the streets. This suggests that the blogs are 1) more of an extension of their public lives than transcendence from them and 2) appear to align with the details of rather full and engaging lives that they write about in some of their blogs.

Some of the bloggers indicated that they were not particularly invested in the movement (ranging from voyeuristic and appreciative to disregard or indifference) at the beginning. However, almost all of the bloggers (from those who were enthusiastic from the start to those who were indifferent) noted a change of heart once they were confronted by the sight of so many protesters on the street and that they were overpowered and inspired-- rather than intimidated-- by the spectacle of mass movement and sense of community and collective action/consciousness while participating in major events, like the shutdown of the Bay Area Port during Occupy Oakland. On 1/18/2011, Cemetery Tourist recalls: *"The Occupy Movement didn't really actually stick in my mind till I received a call from a friend asking me to meet her at the first port shut down...I had been watching the news and saw an aerial shot of thousands of people marching to the port, but it's one thing seeing it on a TV screen, and completely another when you're surrounded by it in person. I tell you, it blew my fucking mind."* This suggests that the female bloggers may have been more compelled to participate in the movement by the sight of the street protests than they would have been simply through their access to movement information via social media.

What the bloggers documented in their blogs suggests that new social media is more likely a parallel, albeit virtual, battleground on which the movement is being fought, to the street protests. Several bloggers advocated for more action on the streets as well as media reform (dismantling regime-controlled media). Moreover, a few Egyptian bloggers discussed how the use of media as a tool for the revolution and media reform both embody the democratic goals they envision for the revolution (transparency, citizen-centered action/decision, a bottom-up rather than top-down means of receiving information) and many of them claimed that freedom of expression is key to the revolution and the new republic. The blogs and the street movement

were two parts within the movement that worked symbiotically to promote the movement's cause. It is also possible that the blogs demonstrate that, because there was a sense that the "war" was with the media as well as on the streets, the notion that the internet provides a safe haven, in which women feel sufficiently protected enough to access a virtual "public space" and participate in the movement from the comfort of their own home is an inaccurate one. Blogging can be just as dangerous in Egypt as protesting in the street.¹² Most of the female bloggers viewed media activism as equally crucial to the movement as the street protests. No bloggers indicated that blogging was safer or more "feminine" and less daring than physical protest in the street (at least among those that considered media activism revolutionary activity), which incidentally coincides with the statistics showing that males dominate blog activity (Etling, Kelly, Faris and Palfrey 2010, Wilson and Dunn 2011).

3. Ordinary Resistance: "I want no leader"... "way of life"... "part of a community"

Many of the bloggers praised the movements for being a leaderless and borne of the people. Egyptocracy writes on 2/9/2011: *"I have no leader and want no leader. This revolution might have been ignited by a few, but their anonymity is key to its success. January 25 is a people's revolution. It started out as a simple protest, grew into an uprising and finally matured into a revolution, because of the will of the masses... having no leader is completely confusing the regime. The revolution's actions are unpredictable; how will they study the behavior of an array of people by the millions according to most recent estimates. Our anonymous unity is making it impossible for the regime to infiltrate our lines, thus staying strong. I regard it as a tactical strength. So, no I want no leader."* Egyptocracy regards "leaderlessness" as an essential tactical strategy to maintain the integrity of the movement-- sharing elsewhere in the entry that she believes that leaders make it easier for the regime to target and dismantle the resistance. Several other female bloggers seem to share the same sentiments about leaderless protesters organizing, though not as concisely and as passionately as Egyptocracy. The revolution, as documented by the bloggers, seems to be composed of a number of smaller committees and groups that have leaders themselves but no sole leader of all the groups. Overall, the bloggers support the claim that the organization and tactics were non-hierarchical and stratified.

This finding resonates with how many bloggers from both blog sets frequently described

¹² "Egypt arrests another blog critic." BBC News. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/6164798.stm

or characterized the movement as a “*community*” and emphasized descriptions of scenes of ordinary resistance (occupying cafes, food kitchens, to simply loitering around and chatting about the movement). Bloggers from both sets noted that on the streets, they and the other protesters were often given to moments of revelry-- music, dancing, singing, chatting as well as fighting off the police. The bloggers documented the use of art and song and poetry as part of the revolution, and characterized the revolution as party-like. They also recalled meeting and bonding with people that they might have never talked to while out during the street demonstrations. Many of the tactics the bloggers documented invoked the “personal is political” mantra. On 2/8/2011, Nermeena recounts that the revolution seemed like a “*Facebook event*.” Some bloggers characterized the protests as a “homey” environment-- one in which they “*snuggled*” with other protesters and became acquainted with strangers (ma3t, 1/30/2011). Similarly, Ruth Miller, a law student, recounts on 11/3/2011: “*I saw people I knew from around Bay Area, and had a great time talking Bay Area politics (as always). This is what it feels like to be part of a community.*”

Another pronounced theme was how so many of the bloggers characterized the movements not as a political event with a set window of time (e.g. from the start of protests to the collapse of the government or achieved policy actions) but as a long process of ordinary resistance in which individuals change the way they live. They define the movement not just as an event but a way of life and praise the movement itself for being a manifestation of the way they believe society should be structured. For the Egyptian Revolution, the bloggers conveyed that they believed the movement itself is not consist only of ousting the oppressive regime but the model of how an ideal society should function—the revolution itself being the change they want to see in society and the revolutionaries living their ideals. Natural Conspiracy wrote on 2/6/2011: “*Tahrir has become a miniature Egyptian republic, offering a brighter outlook on a possible way of life for the whole of Egypt.*” Even so, a couple bloggers, like Inanities and Dalia Ziada, remarked that the setbacks to the movement structured as ordinary resistance include the possibility of not achieving any tactile goals (Dalia Ziada, 4/9/2011)-- “*turned protesting into a habit rather than a means to get to our real goals.*”

Nonetheless, a couple bloggers argued that the movement as a formless and temporally indeterminate period of ordinary resistance is simply part of the process of movement maturation. On 11/5/2011, Love, Health, and Advocacy wrote: “*I’m not really bothered by the*

fact that #Occupy Oakland has no real concrete position. I feel that this is a movement that is a work in progress....As well planned as the Civil Rights Movement has reportedly been, I find it hard to believe that there were no instances where a protest didn't achieve a specific goal. I think that maybe there were instances in the past where people engaged in civil disobedience and protested because they were merely upset over what was happening and had no real goal in mind except to just register their complaint." She opines that while the Occupy Oakland movement is perhaps too free-form for the comfort of some of its participants, it will eventually develop into a well-thought out and organized movement-- though not without an initial phase which consists of getting information out to and establishing a presence within the public in order to gain its support.

Cultural Comparison: Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy Movement

While I was surprised by how much more alike than different the Egyptian and the Occupy bloggers were to one another, despite the many cultural and political differences I imagined would set them apart from one another, there were distinct features from both blog sets pertaining to "Issues" and "Tactics." While both sets of bloggers were alike in their conviction of social media's importance in social movements and their praise of the movements' leaderless organization, the gendered (and non-gendered) issues that were raised and differences in opinion about movement tactics and their roles in their respective movements differed.

Profiles: The Egyptian Revolution and Occupy Bloggers

A. Similarities

Most of the bloggers were active on the streets as well as on their blogs throughout the movements. I found that many of the blogs were not merely activist blogs, in the sense that the blogs were started for the purpose of activism and political commentary. Many of the blogs were secular or lifestyle blogs which functioned very much like online diaries through which the female bloggers could share their thoughts and lives with virtual and actual communities, which is consistent with research/studies that have mapped the use of blogs among young women (Etling, Kelly, Faris and Palfrey 2010). Moreover, the blogs had hybridized content-- meaning that the bloggers blogged about both the movement or political matters and personal/lifestyle subjects-- even the blogs that were more overtly political (e.g. Dalia Ziada, Egyptian Chronicle

and Love, Health and Advocacy). Many of the blogs combined a journalistic/professional style with a more expressive tone in narrating events about the movement-- personal narratives fusing with journalistic documentation of movement events. Many of the female bloggers were most active on their blogs during the revolution, though blog activity declined steeply after the high points of the revolution, even while others who had been blogging before consistently continued to blog about the movement. Most of the consistent bloggers appear to be the ones with the highest level of influence and were likely more invested in the movement or considered “activism” a job.

Some of the bloggers were journalists or had previously written for publications and posted links to their work (e.g. Inner Workings of My Mind, Nermeena and Excremental Virtue) which suggests that blogging may just be an extension of their “professional lives.” Other bloggers made it more apparent that their blogs were an extension of their identities as activists (e.g. Leila Zahra-Mortada and Eiko Huh). Others yet were simply students and/or young women whose blogs functioned as virtual journal-forums -- a personal journal and a public “chatroom” through which they sought commentary and discussion from their readers. Many of the bloggers did not reveal their identities on their blogs and most of them cultivated aliases, but as far as I could tell, apart from their aliases, the blogs seemed to consist of forthright narratives absent of efforts to cultivate personas that are drastically different compared to their real life identities. Moreover, those who created aliases also had Twitter accounts which revealed full names and personal information either deliberately or unintentionally withheld from viewers. It was apparent that blogs were instruments the bloggers wielded in their movement activity that they used to help to mobilize information and individuals and organize the movement, rather than a “haven” in which they were free to participate without the hazards of being part of a social movement.

B. Differences

While the Egyptian bloggers often belonged to a close network of blogs, the networking between the Occupy female bloggers seemed to take place primarily on Twitter. This suggests that those part of the Occupy movement, at least within this blog set, either were not as closely networked together as bloggers in the Egyptian Revolution or there was simply less reliance on blogs in the Occupy movement than in the Egyptian Revolution. I also considered that this

finding could be reflective of the possibility that more of the organizing in the Occupy movement was done physically (e.g. at the General Assembly meetings), because public spaces are not as heavily policed in the Bay Area relative to Egypt.

Both sets of bloggers were also physically present as well as active on their blogs throughout the movement, but the level of commitment from the Occupy bloggers, as indicated by the consistency of blog activity throughout and after the heat of the Occupy movement (October 2011-January 2012), was more sporadic and often simply stopped. While some of the bloggers from the Egyptian blog set identified as activists while the others identified simply as females who happened to protest, almost all of the Occupy bloggers were either self-declared writers and/or journalists and/or activists in some capacity. Three of the Occupy bloggers started their blogs specifically in response to the movement, while another three bloggers had blogged primarily about personal matters, until their blogs became in part (momentarily) dedicated to the Occupy movement. Based on some guesswork, the female bloggers composing the Occupy set appear to be younger on average than those composing the Egyptian Revolution blog set, and more of them appear to be students as well.

Within the Egyptian blog set, I found for the most part, that the blogger's level of influence correlated with how she identified herself in her blog; a finding that emerged as I reviewed the methods by which I accumulated my blog sets.¹³ The blogs I found first were the most prominent female bloggers in the revolution, and the more prominent the blogger was, the more likely it was that she had identified herself as an activist. The next tier of female bloggers, prominence-wise, were those who identified as "journalists," while the remaining female bloggers-- who identified mainly as "bloggers"-- were "sporadic protesters." There was also a blurred line between journalist and activist within the Egyptian blog set which might appear peculiar to some individuals at first, but makes more sense as one considers the significance that the freedom of thought and of the press has for many of the protesters and that the media itself has to the Egyptian Revolution. In other words, the Egyptian bloggers and their relationship to their blogs emerge in two stratifications: a blogger who is 1) a female activist and/or journalist by profession whose blog is for activist purposes and 2) a female, who happens to protest, whose

¹³ In determining the level of influence of each blogger from the Egyptian Revolution, I considered: how many links to other bloggers they had on their own blogs/the blog networks to which they belonged, how many times their blogs appeared on other bloggers' "blogrolls," the number of Twitter followers (many of them also had Twitter accounts), the number of visitors or commenters, and prominence in the news (whether they or their blogs

secular/lifestyle blog becomes a vehicle of activism after the start of the revolution.

Within the Occupy set, I found that the blogger's level of influence correlated, not with her blogging activity, but with the extent of her Twitter activity.¹⁴ The blogs I found first were those of the more prominent female bloggers in the movement, but unlike the Egyptian Revolution blog set, there was no relation between prominence as a blogger and identification as an activist and/or journalist. Additionally, while the few bloggers that remained active on their blogs after the heat of the movement were likely to consider themselves activists, many of the other bloggers who also considered themselves activists were not as active on their blogs after that period. The relationship the female Occupy bloggers had to their blogs differed slightly from the two-tiered structure of the Egyptian bloggers to blogs. Many more of the Occupy bloggers considered themselves activists that were active in other social justice causes even before the Occupy movement began, so while many of them were 1) female activists who blogged about activism as one of their activities—the Occupy movement as another cause— 2) a few others were simply females who began protesting during and blogging the movement.

Gender at Different Junctions: “protected and defended” and “defiance to my boyfriend”

Looking at the Egyptian blog set, gender was mentioned by the bloggers in three circumstances: 1) first to remark on its insignificance during the early street protests; 2) to recap somewhat conscious and unconscious gender-segregated activity in the streets; and 3) to speak—after the peak of the revolution (January to February 2011)—about how appalled they were with the treatment of women protesters who were and continue to be targeted for their gender. These findings suggest that perhaps it is not so much a question of how gender is performed, at least during street protests, but 1) when it is performed and 2) when they are conscious of it being performed. Many of the Egyptian blogs did not speak about women being harassed during the protests simply for the fact that they were female until after the heat of the revolution. After that point, many of the protesters spoke about their outrage toward the sexual harassment of

were mentioned in articles about the revolution).

¹⁴ In determining the level of influence of each blogger from the Occupy movement, I resorted to a different method than I used with the Egyptian Revolution bloggers, because the method through which I accumulated the blogs for this set was different as well. I compiled blogs mostly through Twitter lists (starting with those who followed or who were being followed by larger Twitter accounts like the “OccupyBay Area” account). Therefore the level of influence of each blogger was gauged by considering: 1) the blogger's popularity (based on membership in prominent curated lists and number of followers; 2) level of commentary on the blogs; and 3) how far into the search process I found the blog.

female protesters, the “blue bra girl” incident and the “virginity testing” of female protesters.¹⁵

Many of the Egyptian bloggers (e.g. Natural Conspiracy, ma3t) documented how the more physical aspects of the street protests were taken upon by mainly young, but also some older, men. Such incidents include the formation of safety committees to safeguard homes from thugs and the police and in general to protect the more vulnerable protesters on the streets (though none of the bloggers explicitly identified women as the sole beneficiaries of this protection). Some of the female bloggers also documented their roles as “medics” (caring for the injured) or feeding the street protesters (which were often young men). Natural Conspiracy noted that during the protest, segregation of the men and women occurred but did not attach any apparent hierarchal value to the segregation. She also observed groups of women holding their own separate demonstrations within the larger movement, while other women led chants within the larger demonstrations. There were also particular moments that mixed but also confirmed gender roles, such when Inanities observed a “*young woman [leading] the chants and, when the thugs appeared told the men to stand firm*” (1/27/2011). On 3/26/2011, Leila Zahra-Mortada interviews a female protester who says: “*Some people still believe women should be protected and defended, and we saw that on the streets during demonstrations and actions. [...] instead of fighting the thugs and the police they were trying to protect us and as a result we all ended up being attacked. But on the other hand, for a lot of these men they never saw women doing the same things they do, and never saw women taking action and being on the front-line by their side. This was enlightening for many men, you could easily hear men tell women “you are such a man” and they meant it in a positive way. I don’t like it, but it showed a change in their perspective about women.*” It is apparent that the documented women’s activity during the street protests complicates traditional notions of gender. Men played a protective role and were said to be more active (in numbers) during the street protests, but the bloggers mentioned women protesting at the frontlines just as often.

Within the Occupy Bay Area blog set, there were virtually no reports about whether gender affected how Bay Area protesters organized on the ground. While this might lead me to assume that the Egyptian bloggers may be more cognizant of gender roles than the Occupy bloggers, it is important to note that no assertions were made about gender in social media

¹⁵ “Egypt’s Women Find Power Still Hinges on Men.” The New York Times. <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/10/world/middleeast/egyptian-women-confront-restrictions-of-patriarchy.html>

resistance by either of the blog sets. Despite the Occupy blog set conveying that gender was not in any way an issue during the street protests, a few of the Occupy bloggers, Ninanerdface and Cemetery Tourist, indicated that gender played a more understated role in their movement involvement. On 12/20/2011, Ninanerdface confides in her readers about her relationship troubles while explaining why she needs help funding her “*Occupy journey*”—an intended trip to as many of the Occupy sites as she can make. It is interesting to note that she describes this movement not just as a sweeping historical movement but as an intensely personal “*journey*.” The entry appeals to reader sympathies in order to motivate them to help her participate in the movement. Similarly, on 1/18/2012, Cemetery Tourist writes: “*In an act of defiance to my boyfriend, at first I just watched from the outside by donating food, clothing, and water when I could, as well as watching U streams of Occupy Wall Street, but that was pretty much it...*” After previous blog entries documenting her teacher’s failure to engage her in the movement, she describes how she finally took initiative “in defiance of her boyfriend” and began learning for herself what the movement was about instead of solely relying on him for news about political on-goings. In a sense, these bloggers, while saying nothing about gendered participation in the street movement, reveal seemingly more gendered motives for participating in this movement than the Egyptian bloggers. Gender roles or notions of gender were affirmed, defied, and sometimes mixed both on the streets of the Egyptian Revolution and in the blogs within both sets. Even so, I kept in mind that gender might be performed online as it is done in the streets through communication styles—perhaps revealing itself through a more feminine, personal narrative style in the blog entries which melded both personal details of their lives with advocacy. I found that while many of the blogs from both sets were fused “diary entries” with “political advocacy,” it seemed that the Occupy bloggers were more candid toward readers about the intimate details of their personal lives.

Issues: “in case you are attacked” and “the ‘greater’ cause”

The sight of women at the physical protests was a phenomenon that was in itself noteworthy to many of the female Egyptian bloggers. Dalia Ziada commented on “*the massive participation of women; not only the young educated women who uses the internet but also the grassroots uneducated older women from rural cities*” (2/3/2011). However, the only mentions made about gendered participation in the movements centered on the Egyptian bloggers’ the

recaps of the street protests in which they noted that sexual harassment was absent and present in alternating turns at very specific points during the Egyptian Revolution. At the height of the movement, Leila Zahra-Mortada noted that both the men and women did not stand for the harassment of women protesters in the few instances that it occurred and they collectively came to the rescue of the victim. There was, however, some indication that males played a more protective role in the physical protests. On 2/6/2011 ma3t recounts that she was sheltered from the sexual harassment that typically occurred on a daily basis before the revolution: *“I have to clarify this: I was not brave, I was protected.”* While I cannot discount the possibility that male bloggers would express similar sentiments, I concluded that it—along with a number of similar blog sentiments expressed by other Egyptian bloggers— that ma3t implied that she was protected by the male protesters, because of the context of the whole blog entry from which this excerpt was extracted. Both before and after this statement, ma3t documents how masses of young men sprang into action to protect her and the other protesters: *“...then came 4 guys running at me, they looked like the kind of guys I would normally avoid in the street for fear of sexual harassment, but they were running for my help...”* She reveals awareness— similarly displayed by a few other Egyptian female bloggers— about how typical street practices (sexual harassment of women) informed by commonplace gender attitudes were overturned during the early period of the revolution.

One Long Road and Inner Workings of My Mind underscore how gender was both important and unimportant in the movement by highlighting the concerns that some of the women had about their physical integrity while engaging in the street demonstrations. One Long Road expressed how surprised she was to be so well-treated contrary to her expectations as a female protester (2/5/2011): *“People usually harass you on the streets, but on Tuesday (the first) during the Million Man March, a million people in Tahrir, people standing so close, no one touched me inappropriately, or looked at me in such a way, or verbally harassed me or anything.”* Likewise, on 3/15/2011, Inner Workings of My Mind wrote: *“We were making fun of a group of our girlfriends who were taking the proposed January 25 protests way too seriously – we felt. Those girlfriends had started a girls-only Facebook group a few days before to give advice to each other about how to handle oneself during a protest: what do you bring with you, what do you wear, how do you protect yourself in case you are attacked.”* Some of the younger female protesters formed a Facebook in anticipation that they would be targeted differently as

females at the street protests. Considerations of gender in the Egyptian Revolution (apart from the anxieties about protesting as females on the streets and the different roles many of the women played from the men) were expressed primarily through the bloggers' indignation toward how female protesters were treated after the peak of the movement. On 12/30/2011, Egyptian Chronicles wrote scorning the "blue bra incident," in which the police targeted a female protester and stripped off her upper garments on the streets. However, she also wrote about how the reactions of the men were somewhat in flux: *"The Pro-Revolution supporters call the girl now 'The girls' lady' in a sign of respect as 'Set El Banat' in Arabic. Some old male activists are still thinking in their old manly way and proposed to marry her in disgusting and silly way."*

Though differences (e.g. gender, class and other minority interests) were absent during both the movements, the interest groups who were being alienated (as deduced from the blog entries) differed between the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy movement. The Egyptian bloggers conveyed that females likely had vested (gendered) interests in the movement that were not explicitly expressed but which they believed was inherently related to issues of individual liberty and democracy. However, the main movement would push the issue of women's rights aside claiming that the national goal was momentarily the main priority. On 3/26/2011, a female protester reflected, in Leila-Zahra Mortada's blog, upon the insignificance of gender out on the streets during the heat of the movement: *"...on January 25th and the days that followed I felt for the first time in Egypt that I was being treated as a person and not the way women were viewed, and that felt great. Women were part of the entire revolution [...] we all had one goal, one threat, and we were all part of the same thing. Women were beaten up, tortured, killed and fought back and stood in front of tanks. For the first time you couldn't differentiate between the roles of men and women, and this is why I would rather say a lot of Egyptians were beaten up, tortured, killed and fought back and stood in front of tank."* But two months later, on 5/27/2011, Leila Zahra-Mortada writes: *"...we all fight for the "greater" cause. Over and over we have waited, and put the "greater" cause ahead, only to find ourselves pushed back once things are settled. [...] We have learned that yes the time is not right simply because the time for us to speak out was yesterday. Our demands do not break the "movement", it is the "movement" that breaks itself by not including us."* What was reported in the blog entries suggests that 1) the timing of when gender was explicitly discussed by the Egyptian bloggers corresponds to when it became an issue in the larger movement and 2) gender-role-awareness and gendered concerns

are muted in the heat of a social movement in order to achieve a common goal. Gender differences only really emerged after the peak of revolution activity when men were said to be more critical or fearful of what more liberties for women might mean for themselves.¹⁶

However, within the Occupy movement, no blogs reported women being alienated as an interest group though a couple of blogs vaguely indicated that there were other groups being alienated. Eiko Huh (a blogger of color) gave readers the sense that there were other interest groups that were originally part of the larger movement but who were now breaking into factions with sometimes conflicting agendas and interests for the larger movement. They also both call attention to the problem of an organization they claim has attached itself to the movement called the “BlackBloc” whose violent tactics they feel contravenes the strategy of civil disobedience that is paramount to the movement. Eiko does not explicitly identify the groups participating in the “infighting” (1/18/2011) though Love, Health and Advocacy similarly vaguely indicates that “infighting” is occurring within the movement (11/1/2011): *“Many complain that there isn’t a specific goal or plan and that there are too many issues to address. True. The occupy movement is not merely about banks taking our money to line their own pockets, or about lack of jobs. It’s about issues with race, class, prejudice.”* These differences in which groups constituted the minority interests between the two movements seem logical, based on the issues at the root of each of the movements and the geography of the movement. The Egyptian Revolution is composed mostly of Egyptians with a single national, historical background while the Occupy movement is composed of individuals with varied historical backgrounds (e.g. immigrants, a unique American history of race) and who are preoccupied mainly with class concerns. Additionally, only a few bloggers from each movement identified themselves as feminists within the larger movement, and even then, at least during the peak of the movements, their concerns were that of the larger movement’s concerns.

Movement Tactics: “The Press” and “inexperienced, over-excited little girls”

While many of the bloggers from both sets shared the belief that ordinary resistance (starting conversations, altering discourse, political or otherwise) was a way for anyone to be a part of the movement, what the bloggers believed constituted involvement in the movement

¹⁶ “Women have emerged as key players in the Arab spring” The Guardian.
<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/apr/22/women-arab-spring>

differed between the Egyptian and the Occupy bloggers. A few Egyptian bloggers documented their role in the movement as medics and bringers of food and aid to the street demonstrators, but not all of them considered themselves “revolutionaries” on par with the street protesters. Some bloggers considered being part of the media mechanism in the movement a crucial revolutionary role, while others, who considered social media to be no less important, considered it “revolution-lite.” This is due, perhaps, to those individuals having more gendered notions of what constitutes action or political action in a social movement—a more classical notion of the “political” constituting political acts versus the notion that “personal is political.”

A few Egyptian bloggers indicated that they thought of activism as a profession (considering participating in movement activity a job, though this is a notion distinguished from the bloggers from both sets who conceive of activism and the movement as a “way of life”), even while it seemed the majority of the bloggers believed that an activist could be a person who simply protests (anyone, even at the margins of the movement). Inner Workings of My Mind wrote on 3/15/2011: *“Arwa and I spent at least two hours gossiping about our friends and how serious they were taking it all. “They think they will change the face of Egypt,” Arwa joked and I laughed in return. “They’ve never been to a demonstration in Egypt before. They have no understanding of how these things go,” I said superiorly, having had been to – and even led – countless demonstrations since my university years. Arwa and I decided two days before to separate from the larger group. We weren’t up to dealing with inexperienced, over-excited little girls.”* This particular blogger, a seasoned activist, mocks the younger female protesters for their optimism and even underestimates the scope of the revolution in its early phases. However, while her expectations (as veteran and thus perhaps a more jaded female activist) for the revolution and opinion of the less experienced female protesters were low from the start, it seems that her skepticism and the feelings she held about activism being “for the professionals” gives way to her acknowledgement that she is one of the many individuals on the streets who are dazzled by spectacle of mass protest in Tahrir Square.

The Occupy bloggers seemed to have a more liberal notion of participating in the movement— more of them were likely to believe that starting a conversation and other similarly “peripheral” activities to street demonstrations constituted participation— whereas a few of the Egyptian bloggers hinted that they believed their own roles at the periphery of the movement did not really constitute true movement activity. On 11/1/2011, Love, Health and Advocacy lists a

number of ways individuals can participate in Occupy Bay Area without occupying physical spaces in the city-- and most of those alternatives involved either educating or getting educated. While, many of the bloggers from both sets were adamant in their conviction that starting conversations was revolutionary activity and considered participation, there was less ambivalence from the Occupy bloggers that media activism and other non-physical or non-street demonstration protesting are activism in the same capacity as street protests.

While the blogs from both sets documented experiences on the ground as well as critiques of the movement (doubts and concerns about some of the movement's tactics), reflective critique of the movement was more prominent in the Occupy blogs than in the Egyptian blogs. The Occupy bloggers 1) placed more explicit emphasis on how one of the movement's goals is to alter existing political discourse in order to facilitate positive institutional and non-institutional change and 2) expressed more aggressively grievances and suspicions against mainstream media. The second finding might seem peculiar due to the United States' relative media freedom compared to the highly controlled media of Egypt, though I interpreted the finding to be perhaps indicative of the female Occupy bloggers' self-awareness of their roles as "citizen journalists" within the info-sphere component of the movement. Ninanerdface identifies the role of her blog as supplementary news in relation to mainstream media on 9/28/2011: "*The Press won't talk about Occupy Wall Street, so I will! Will you?*" Similarly, on 1/18/2012, Cemetery Tourist documents on her infuriation with how "*mainstream media*" chooses to selectively capture certain moments of the Occupy movement in a way that prevents the public from seeing the worst of the abuse of the street protesters. Excremental Virtue, on 1/30/2012, blogged an insider's recap-- including Tweets from several female protesters present at the scene-- on what happened during a particular protest in the Bay Area when the police prevented people from leaving but subsequently arrested everyone within the blockade for refusing to disperse. She clearly states that she wants readers to understand the gravity of the police violations— even in a sideways manner asserting that the purpose of her "*reviewing and documenting*" these moments is to ensure that she meets certain "*standards of proof that sway public opinion.*" While bloggers from both sets consciously use their personal narratives as ammunition to mobilize public sentiment for the cause and to dispel negative or incomplete representations of their respective movements in the mainstream media, it is apparent that Occupy bloggers more consciously position themselves against the mainstream media.

Social Media and Social Movement Theory: Cultural Capital and Social Change

Some preliminary studies conducted soon after the Egyptian Revolution reveal that a very small proportion of individuals who used social media during the protests utilized blogs (Wilson and Dunn 2011). More individuals used other communication avenues, including Twitter, in order to facilitate rapid-fire spread of information to protesters and the community at large. The data even suggests, despite popular news accounts, that social media was not prominent in the demonstrations even though it served a crucial role. Even so, much of the literature about political blogging and social movements suggests that bloggers constitute an important segment of society that is transforming the public sphere and the political process (Cartya and Onyetta 2006).

More recent social movement literature focuses on the nature of social movement organization and how its impacts are measured in society. This newer body of literature posits a challenge to older social movement arguments (Gamson 1990) that more blatantly political strategies in social movements are the most effective way of effecting social change. Much of the newer literature emphasizes instead the more dynamic cultural implications law, as opposed to its instrumental function, in social change as it transforms the assumptions that are shared by all members of society (Kostiner 2003). Similarly, scholars argue that non-violent protest and the altering of political discourse offers individuals a decentralized method of advocating for social change alternative to more state-centric methods (Callahan 1995). While some of the older literature focused primarily on the “political opportunity structure” within and political impacts of movements, the new literature reorients transgression as ordinary resistance and discusses the cultural impacts (such as identity politics and how it factors into social movement mobilization and collective identity) that both prompt collective action in the movements and which affect society long after the movement.¹⁷

Some scholars argue that collective action and identity formation within social movements alter the expectations that the public has for more powerful political actors by discursively framing the movement to “alter the rules of dominant public spheres” and

¹⁷ Pickerill 2009, Buechler 1995, Armstrong and Bernstein 2008, Jasper 1997, Goodwin and Jasper 2004, Picardo 1997, Jenson 1998, Scott 1990, Jasper 1997, Goodwin and Jasper 2004, Johnston 2009, Hamed 2010, Gornick 2011, Reed 2005, Wasserstrom and Peery 1992, Taylor 1999, Einwohner 2000, Foust 2010, Poletta 2006, Gamson 1993, Morris 1999.

effectively making resistance out of the “discourse of everyday life”— a precursor to possible institutional change (Guidry 2003).¹⁸ Taken in consideration with the literature about how public policy agendas may be determined more by the level of public mobilization than legal precedence (Peters 2007), the new direction of social movement literature and the arguments made by the female bloggers for discursive activism reinforce the claim that social media activism, as an arguably less overtly political method of social protest, has more potential to secure the changes sought by protesters. That the Egyptian bloggers blogged in English to a potentially transnational audience also suggests that on some level that they are not only appealing to fellow Egyptians and its local activists but to a world society and global public opinion.¹⁹ There are, however, claims that social media’s impact on social movements is overestimated. A case study of blogging phenomena in Egypt and Iran, reveals that effective social movements involved dynamic collaboration between cyber-activism and street/“real world” efforts— even while acknowledging the value of the internet as a discursive space that offers free-for-all information to the public (Lerner 2010).

How the public and the private boundaries have been altered as well as the boundaries between formal political institutions and civil society can be better understood by what social movement theory envisions about how social movement actors and agendas change the public opinion. Changing technology and communication methods have redefined and perhaps collapsed public and private boundaries and transformed the way individuals relate to politicians, cultural icons, and each other. Thus, the possibility for social movements to have wide-scale impacts on policy and systematic changes, because of the ubiquity of media, is significant. If we consider the literature demonstrating how the discursively framing certain social issues has large impacts on foreign policy in America (Lakoff 2004), it is evident that “talking” is as powerful a resistance tactic as street demonstrations— even though many of the female bloggers in both sets testified to the unique advantages of both types of resistance. Social media activism— even as a milder counterpart to street demonstrations in an era that redefines how individuals communicate and relate with one another and global society— makes it easier than ever to recruit movement

¹⁸ Guidry argues that this discursive process transforms “lived experience” into “compelling political claims” which alters the political process so that more powerful social actors “see political interaction differently” while less powerful social actors are able to realize their own “agency and capacities.”

¹⁹ Some scholars argue that effective social movements influence public opinion by working on a top-down appeal to world society and international norms and a bottom-up strategy of local activism to pressure policy makers from both sides to make policy changes (Tsutsui and Shin 2008).

supporters who will pressure more powerful social actors to address social problems.

VI. CONCLUSIONS

Summary, Discussion and Future Inquiry

The women activists of the Progressive and the Civil Rights Era shared a common belief with the Egyptian Revolution and Occupy Movement bloggers: discursive activism (print-press or the internet) has the power to change the way people talk and think about social and political issues.²⁰ As the data demonstrates, discursive activism has spanned multiple eras of female activism. However, we know now that the roles and tactics taken upon by contemporary female activists, the female bloggers and even some female activists from the Civil Rights movement, have been increasingly dynamic. The female activists augment discursive resistance with street protest participation during social movements.

I was surprised to find that, like past studies conducted about Internet users from the West and the East (Mazzarella 2011), the female Egyptian bloggers were in many ways more alike than they were different from the female Occupy bloggers. As far as the “issues” that were raised, both blog sets alluded to how a feeling of solidarity for the main goals of each movement overruled individual minority interests at the peak of the movement, though divisions emerged among minority interests groups that wanted more control over the agenda as the movements progressed. In terms of “tactics”, most bloggers from both sets saw the merits of a leaderless revolution and the importance of social media in shaping public discourse.²¹ The blogs functioned primarily as a communication medium through which the female bloggers could publicize the movement and mobilize public opinion. However, it was equally clear that while social media was important to the female bloggers, they believed that it was an aspect of a social movement that supplemented street demonstrations and that should eventually lead to reforms through more political avenues. After all, many of the bloggers participated both in the street demonstrations and actively blogged the movements. Many also noted that it was the spectacle of mass mobilization in the streets and the feeling of community to which the masses gave rise that compelled them to participate when they might otherwise have remained witnesses at a

²⁰ Scholars suggest that the print press and the internet alike allow women who utilize these technologies to create imagined communities in which political and material communities coalesce (Beetham 2006).

²¹ Scholars argue that media portrayals of the movement affect public opinion about the movement (McLeod and Detenber 1999, Passy and Giugni 2001).

distance. Ultimately, I found that gender did not motivate the act of female activist blogging, though gender did inform other aspects of movement participation.

However similar the Egyptian and Occupy bloggers were to one another, there were a few distinctions that set them apart from one another. Gender emerged in different junctions of the social movement process. For the Egyptian bloggers, gender roles (and consciousness of them) differentiated among male and female protesters emerged during the street demonstrations, while a couple of the Occupy bloggers revealed gendered motivations for their involvement in the movement. As for “issues”, it seemed that “gender” factored more into the divisions emerging later on within the Egyptian Revolution than it did within the Occupy movement. Unlike the Civil Rights and Progressive movements, in which particular groups, like those pertaining to women’s rights, formed and intermingled with other interest groups under the larger banner of “civil rights,” the aims for the individual Egyptian Revolution and Occupy movement were more particular in nature— class equality and democratic governance. In terms of “tactics”, the Occupy bloggers were more confident that media activism was considered movement participation, while a few Egyptian bloggers, who had more “classical” notions of what constitutes political and/or movement activity, were more dubious of that claim.

As to why the female bloggers did not perform gender through their activist blogging, the findings suggest three possibilities: 1) the nature of the social movements, 2) the nature of the social media the bloggers utilized, and/or 3) changing perceptions about female political participation. While the lack of gender performance among the female bloggers appears to support the post-feminist literature claims that feminism and women’s concerns are no longer of concern to contemporary young women, the blogs suggest that, at best, this claim might only hold for the Occupy bloggers.²² The Egyptian bloggers paid scrupulous attention to how well women were treated during the peak of the movement as well the harassment they suffered once the movement had progressed, expressing outrage toward the lack of regard the Egyptian men had toward women’s rights. These findings thus suggest that it is likely a combination of 1) the nature of the movements and 2) the nature of social media (communication venues altering the relationship between public and private and civil society and political institutions) motivating the lack of gender performance by the female bloggers. Many of the bloggers’ accounts of their

²² The claim that women’s rights and feminism are no longer as important to contemporary women as they were for women in the past, because they feel they are living in a society in which gender equality has been

movement activity support the notion that assuming that the internet somehow makes it possible for women to sidestep gendered boundaries and a public/private boundary does not take into account that the Internet may also adhere to the same institutional dynamics that govern reality.²³ It is possible that the increasing women's presence in the political blogosphere has occurred because rather than in spite of public opinion about women and activism; a possibility that may be directly related to the finding that the collapse of previously rigid boundaries between the state and civil society (involving personal choices and interpersonal relationship) within certain states tends to fuel more individualistic legalistic activity (Boyle 2002). It is thus likely that the strategies for which many of the female bloggers advocated— cultivating public discourse— have been long exercised albeit unnoticed prior to the movements, and their recent visibility is due to the information revolution.

The bloggers generally did not talk explicitly about how they conceived of themselves within public/private boundaries. As to why the young women bloggers did not discuss public and private boundaries and why they chose both to blog and to protest in the streets may be informed by the realities of a changing society, including those leading activists and scholars alike to reevaluate their views on the relationship between law and social change and the distance between civil society and formal institutions (Boyle 2002). It is also possible that discussions of the public and private were at the margins or nonexistent because 1) the nature of public and private has changed with the advent of new communication technologies as is argued by some scholars (Beetham 2006) or 2) many of the female bloggers that were on the ground were also online blogging the movements and so there were no limitations that made participation in the movement a matter of choosing between the two venues of protest. Some scholars argue that there is nothing new about new technology that makes it more or less likely to benefit disadvantaged groups: "Technology is neutral and its deployment is subject to existing structures of power" (Sakr and Mack 2002).²⁴ Others assert that that the internet and Arab female bloggers constitute a new "public sphere" that supports decentralized bottom-up news reporting

achieved (McRobbie 2009, Coppock and Richter 1995).

²³ Some scholars argue that despite claims of the internet being a democratizing tool for social resistance and a possible means for users to breach social boundaries the same institutional hierarchies of power prevalent in reality permeate and reinstate themselves in the blogosphere (Pole 2011, Postmes, Spears and Lea 1998, Beetham 2006).

²⁴ Some scholars suggest that it is possible that this defiance of a public/private dynamic by women is reflective of a social dynamic and mindset already embedded within contemporary social structures (Consuelo and Paasonen 2002). Similarly, others argue that blogs and web-based media are not radical departures from traditional mainstream media and that blogs networks also recreate some of the hierarchies in mainstream media because much

and allows for the exchange of information to occur in a manner that promotes a more dynamic civil society and more individual participation (Nawawy and Khamis 2011, Elsadda 2010).²⁵ Moreover, it is possible that the meager amount of discussion regarding the public and private boundaries among the blog set may just reflect the sample bias in my study. Many of the female bloggers from both sets spoke English and were, or had been at one time, university students—indicating that they have access to resources and likely were more privileged than some of the other female protesters participating in the movement. Their privileges may indicate that they have a level of mobility that is not available to the rural female protesters that participated in the Egyptian revolution.

Some scholars and writers have conveyed skepticism of social media as a social movement tool, claiming that while it allows mobilizers to cast a wider net and reel in more participants while lowering entry barriers and discouragement from participation, this method of mobilization promotes low commitment from and weak and temporary links between participants.²⁶ However, some of the literature on collective consciousness in social movements alludes to the fact that while these shortcomings are valid, the strength of blogs rests in their ability to mobilize public awareness about and political organizing around social issues in the long term (Cartya and Onyetta 2006, Gamson 1992).²⁷ This reasoning, when taken in consideration with Egypt's healthy political blogosphere, might explain the large turnout during the Egyptian Revolution.²⁸ Disdain for the regime among the youth had been long brewing in Egypt's blogosphere.

It is clear from the literature on media and politics and from what I found in the blog entries that the female bloggers envision a very specific role that they as social media mobilizers play in dispelling incomplete representations of the movement in mainstream media, cultivating and/or altering dominant political discourse and even eventually public policy. The changing

of their citizen journalism covers the same information as mainstream media (Haas 2005).

²⁵ Female bloggers can document the informal changes like political resistance in everyday life, which may have gone unnoticed before, but through their blogging, becomes visible (Bahramitash and Hooglund 2011).

²⁶ "Small Change: Why the Revolution will not be Tweeted." The New Yorker. www.newyorker.com/reporting/2010/10/04/101004fa_fact_gladwell?currentPage=all

²⁷ These findings seem consistent with the literature that explores the importance of media, and the way changing technology is changing the way that people talk about issues, in affecting public opinion and eventually policy-making and with studies that find that public policy/judicial decisions are motivated more by the level of activist and interest group mobilization than past legal precedence (Graber 2011, Peters 2007).

²⁸ Studies have shown that internet is widely available in Egypt and that Egypt is one of the most politically active blogospheres in the Arab world; as healthy, in fact, as the United States (Loewenstein 2008, Etling, Kelly,

technology that was mobilized in the Egyptian Revolution changes the way protesters mobilize and organize, and some scholars are inclined to believe that the impacts, though they are immeasurable at present, are actually located in how it erodes the state's ability to monopolize information and, in the long term, its ability to transform the public sphere in a way that will ultimately drive larger changes in society (Lynch 2011, Khamis 2011).²⁹ Likewise, scholars assert that the power of alternative media lies in its ability to generate small changes via cultural capital that make it possible for larger changes to come to fruition (Piepmeier 2009, Atkinson 2007). That being said, the female bloggers of the Egyptian Revolution and of the Occupy movement demonstrate that a revolutionary, despite the power dynamics that may limit her own mobility, can choose to mobilize nonetheless on the streets and in political forums, but may in fact find greater possibilities— as well as a greater challenge— in changing minds first.

Lastly, there were a few limitations to my study that prevented me from being able to make solid conclusions about contemporary female activist bloggers as a group. I could only make inferences based on the female blog entries about how “gender-identity” informs female blogging. The results of my blog coding revealed some interesting possible connections that female gender-identity had to certain preferred types of resistances tactics by the female bloggers as well as implications about how gender-identity factored into how they felt about themselves as females within the social movements, but without a male blog set and “male voices” with which to compare, the findings were subjective at best, and I had to omit them from the final results of the study. Additionally, I did not find any discussion about the public/private boundaries for the most part by the female bloggers, but that may have been due to the sample bias that came with including only female bloggers that blogged in English and that likely spoke primarily to a transnational audience. These limitations might prompt future inquiries as to how gender-identity informs social movement participation and how preferences for social movement organization and tactics cut across both male and female activist bloggers as well as female activists from a more varied socio-economic and class strata than those that likely composed my blog sets.

VII. APPENDICES

The following appendices list the female activists and bloggers that were used in my

Faris and Palfrey 2010, Alavi 2005).

²⁹

Scholars claim that new social media helps reestablish the voice of the public and reengages those who are

study. I list the women in the Progressive Era and the Civil Rights Movement alphabetically. The female bloggers from the Egyptian Revolution and the Occupy Movement, and the blog entries that I drew from for my study, are listed in the chronological order which I found their blogs.

A. Progressive Era and Civil Rights Era Female Activists

i. Progressive Era (1890-1920):

1. Gertrude Simmons Bonnin: author of “American Indian Stories”; published “Indian Newsletter” to continue drive for self-determination and reforms
2. Harriet Maxwell Converse: author “Myths and Legends of the New York State Iroquois”; published works that helped preservation of Native American culture
3. Pauline E. Hopkins: novelist, journalist, playwright who used the romantic novel to explore social and racial themes
4. Susette La Flesche: author and writer of works for Native American rights
5. Alice Dunbar-Nelson: author and poet; wrote advocating for African American rights/abolition
6. Kate Richard O’Hare: published socialist novel “What Happened to Dan?”; co-published and co-edited weekly “National Rip-Saw” with husband
7. Mary White Ovington: author of children’s book “Hazel” and novel “The Shadow” (to alter discriminatory assumptions about blacks); co-created Crisis Publishing Company; published articles like “Half A Man” about racial discrimination
8. Anna Pennybacker: used press to publicize club news and further educational goals in Texas; using the press to influence public opinion
9. Josephine St. Pierre Ruffin: writer and editor of “Boston Courant” (a weekly black paper) and editor of monthly periodical “Woman’s Era”
10. Lillian D. Wald: author and published articles about child welfare

ii. Civil Rights Movement (1950-1980):

1. Emmie Schrader Adams: helped produce filmstrips/photos for a project documenting black

at the periphery of society (Saeed 2009).

and white poverty and the Mississippi Freedom Democratic Party; published papers

2. Elaine DeLott Baker: wrote papers— including “Semi-Introspective” and “The Position of Women in the Movement” about women’s rights
3. Ella Baker: worked in editorial positions for “American West Indian News” and “Negro National News”
4. Charlotta Bass: journalist at alternative press “The Eagle” coverage of issues important to black community
5. Daisy Bates: author and co-founded “Arkansas State Press” with husband— covered discrimination, segregation and police brutality against African Americans
6. Shirley Chisholm: author and publisher of articles about African American rights
7. Angela Davis: authored “If They Come in the Morning” about prison conditions and other works for African American and women’s rights
8. Dorothy Dawson Burlage: published articles/works about women’s rights; contributed to anthology “Sexist Religion and Women in the Church”
9. Dorothy Day: publisher of “The Catholic Worker” which covered various anti-war issues
10. Ada Deer: author and writer of works for Native American and women’s rights
11. Lorraine Hansberry: writer at “Freedom” magazine and playwright (“Raisin in the Sun”) expose racial discrimination of African Americans
12. Casey Hayden: published papers on women’s rights
13. Dorothy I. Heights: author and published in magazines about African American rights
14. Ethyl A. Johnson: published “Did You Know?” for the “Crusader” about African American civil rights
15. Barbara Jordan: author and writer of works for civil rights for African Americans
16. Daisy S. Lampkin: writer and editor of Pittsburgh Courier, top-circulating black newspaper by the 1950s
Margaret C. McCulloch: published pamphlets and wrote papers on racial problems in the South
17. Graciela Olivarez: author and published in magazines about Mexican American rights
18. Amelia Stone Quinton: wrote about Native American rights

19. Lillian Smith: author and published articles about racial discrimination in the South
20. Sue Thrasher: published newsletters “The New South Student” and wrote for “Southern Patriot” and started a journal “Southern Exposure” publishing about African America rights in the South
21. Ida Bell Wells-Barnett: author about African American rights and anti-lynching issue
22. Margaret Bush Wilson: published in alternative press and in journals works about civil rights for African Americans

B. Egyptian Revolution Female Blogger Profiles

Egyptian Chronicle

Identity: 1) identifies with “girl”; 2) blogger; 3) activist
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle/Informative
 Movement Activity: communication and physically present
 Level of influence: High; many links to other bloggers and sites
 Entries: journalistic
 - 2/4/2011
 - 2/12/2011
 - 12/20/2011

The Bubble of Thoughts

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) activist
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle/Informative
 Movement Activity: communication and physically present
 Level of influence: High; link to other bloggers and sites
 Entries: journalistic; personal narrative
 - 1/29/2011
 - 2//2011
 - 3/24/2011

Egyptocracy

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) activist
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle/Political: “political and cultural commentary”
 Movement Activity: communication and physically present
 Level of influence: High; links to other bloggers; appears in many blogrolls
 Entries: journalistic/ professional
 - 2/9/2011: I want no Leader
 - 7/23/2011: Rebranding our Demands

Leila Zahra-Mortada:

Identity: 1) self-proclaimed female activists/blogger; making a documentary about the Arab Spring women activists

Age: young woman

Blog type: Secular/Informative; “political commentary”

Movement Activity: communication

Level of influence: High; links to other bloggers and sites

Entries: journalistic and expressive

- 3/16/2011

- 3/26/2011: Whispers of Cairo in thunderbolts

- 5/17/11: We Are Doing It

Obliviology

Identity: 1) female blogger

Age: young woman; mother

Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like

Movement Activity: communication and physically present (bringing food/drink to protesters)

Level of influence: Medium; links to other bloggers; healthy level of commentary to posts

Entries: personal narrative

- 2/3/2011: Square of Angels

Eurekaisms

Profile description (identity blurb): anonymous, no profile or “About” section; can only infer that she is a female based on certain posts.

Identity: 1) female blogger; moved by what she saw on the streets to participate

Age: younger woman?

Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like

Blog description: unisex graphics

Movement Activity: communication and physically present

Level of influence: Medium; on some blogrolls

Entries: personal narrative and journalistic

- 2/2/2011: Egypt’s People Have Found Their Voice

- 2/3/2011: Crimes Against Humanity

- 3/11/2011: Post Adrenaline Rush

Nermeena

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) journalist? Has published stuff

Age: young woman

Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like

Movement Activity: communication

Level of influence: Medium; links to other bloggers; healthy level of commentary to posts

Entries: personal narrative; very expressive

- 2/8/2011: Tahrir- Taghyeer

- 4/5/2011: Poetry for Revolution's sake

Natural Conspiracy

Identity: 1) female blogger
 Age: young woman/ student
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like
 Movement Activity: communication and physically present
 Level of influence: Medium; links to other bloggers
 Entries: personal narrative
 - 2/2/2011
 - 2/6/2011

Inanities

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) researcher at an institute
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like
 Movement Activity: communication (started a collaborative to provide short updates and physically present
 Level of influence: High; on many blogrolls; through twitter; healthy commentary
 Entries: personal narrative and journalistic
 - 1/27/2011
 - 1/31/2011
 - 2/5/2011

One Long Road

Identity: 1) female blogger
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like
 Movement Activity: communication and physically present for 3/10 of the days
 Level of influence: Medium; on some blogrolls
 Entries: personal narrative
 -1/26/2012
 - 1/28/2011
 - 2/5/2011

Inner Workings of my Mind

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) journalist
 Age: young woman
 Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle; diary-like
 Movement Activity: communication (Twitter) and physically present
 Level of influence: Medium; on some blogrolls
 Entries: hybrid—personal narrative and journalistic
 - 2/7/2011
 - 3/15/2011

Dalia Ziada

Identity: 1) activist 2) female blogger 3) journalist

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political/Secular

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter) and physically present

Level of influence: High; on many blogrolls; in the news; high twitter presence

Entries: hybrid personal narrative and journalistic

- 2/3/2011

- 4/9/2011: It's getting ugly! It's getting violent!

ma3t

Identity: 1) female blogger

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political/Secular

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter) and physically present

Level of influence: Medium; on some blogrolls (still blogged about movement after the heat of the movement)

Entries: personal narrative, expressive

- 1/30/2011: Long Live the Revolution of the Egyptian people

- 2/6/2011: I was not brave! I was protected

- 12/31/2011: My Bloody Revolution Wednesday

C. Occupy Movement Female Blogger Profiles

Eiko Huh: Occupy Oakland-- Oakland Movement

Identity: 1) activist 2) turned female blogger

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political/Secular; blog started around the time the OO movement commenced

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter) and physically present

Level of influence: High; on some blogrolls; on many Twitter lists

Entries: journalistic and personal narrative

- 11/13/2011

- 11/20/2011

- 12/23/2011

- 1/18/2011

Elle of Oakland

Profile description (identity blurb): "As some of you may or may not know, my name is Elle. I'm an Occupy Oakland medic, and I've decided to use this as a space to share my own personal brand of street medic etiquette, fashion, and other helpful hints."

Identity: 1) street "medic"/activist 2) female blogger

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political (for the movement)

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter/more active there) and physically present

Level of influence: High; high # of twitter followers; on many Twitter lists

Entries: personal narrative and journalistic

- 12/7/2011: "Meeting Miss Elle"

- 12/17/2011

Ninanerdface

Identity: 1) female blogger turned 2) activist

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political/Secular/Lifestyle

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter/active there) and physically present (traveled to other Occupy movements)

Level of influence: Medium; appears in some Occupy lists; no links to other blogs

Entries: personal narrative

- 9/28/2011

- 12/20/2011

Naedesu's left coast adventures

Identity: 1) activist 2) female blogger-active in other social causes prior to

Occupy

Age: young woman

Blog type: Political/Secular/Lifestyle

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter/more active there) and physically present

Level of influence: Low; found late in search

Entries: personal narrative

- 1/7/2012: #Free Khali & All Our Political Prisoners!

- 1/7/2012: No Justice! No Peace!

Cemetery Tourist

Identity: 1) girl 2) turned activist 3) turned female blogger

Age: teenage girl/older-teen? Mention of her "teachers"

Blog type: Political; for the express purpose of documenting Occupy Oakland movement experience; seems to have cooled down after heat of movement

Movement Activity: communication (Twitter) and physically present

Level of influence: Low; found late in the search process

Entries: personal narrative

- 1/18/2012: Memoirs of the Occupy Revolution Part 1. The begining

[sp]

- 3/11/2012: Memoirs of the Occupy Revolution Part 2: The night of the OGP shooting

Excremental Virtue

Identity: 1) female blogger 2) writer

Age: young woman/ student

Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle

Movement Activity: communication (has twitter/more active there) and physically present

Level of influence: Low; found late in search process

Entries: journalistic

- 1/30/2012: Documenting police activity during the OO protests

Love, Health, and Advocacy

Identity: 1) activist 2) female blogger

Age: young woman/ student

Blog type: Political/Secular/Lifestyle

Movement Activity: communication/educating (has Twitter/more active there)

Level of influence: Low/Medium; found late in search; some links to other sites and blogs

Entries: personal narrative and journalistic

- 11/1/2011: Which side am I on? #Occupy Oakland's

- 11/5/2011: Should #OccupyOakland Campers Stay? I don't know.

Ruth Miller

Identity: 1) journalist 2) female blogger

Age: young woman/ student

Blog type: Secular/Lifestyle

Movement Activity: physically present

Level of influence: Low; late in search; no links; few comments

Entries: journalistic/ professional

- 11/3/2011: Marching with Occupy Oakland to the Port

- 11/7/2011: Occupy Oakland and Zoning

VIII. WORKS CITED

- Alavi, Nasrin. We Are Iran: the persian blogs. Soft Skull Press: Brooklyn, NY, 2005.
- Armstrong, Elizabeth A. and Mary Bernstein. "Culture, Power, and Institutions: A Multi-Institutional Politics Approach to Social Movements." *Sociological Theory* 26.1(2008): 74-99. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-9558.2008.00319.x/full>>.
- Atkinson, Joshua. "Contemporary Crusaders and Timeless Elders: Building Cultural Capital through Alternative Media Texts." *Popular Communication: The International Journal of Media and Culture* 5.3 (2007): 171-190. Web. 10 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/15405700701384848>>.
- Bahramitash, Roksana and Eric Hooglund, eds. Gender in Contemporary Iran: Pushing the boundaries. Routledge: London, 2011.
- Beetham, Margaret. "Periodicals and the new media: Women and imagined communities." *Womens Studies International Forum* 29.3 (2006): 231-240. Web. 14 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0277539506000136>>.
- Boyle, Elizabeth Heger. "Is Law the Rule? Using Political Frames to Explain Cross-National Variation in Legal Activity." *Social Forces* 79.2 (2002): 385-418. Web. JSTOR. 27 Sept. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/2675504>>.
- Brenner, Suzanne. "Private Moralities in the Public Sphere: Democratization, Islam, and Gender in Indonesia." *American Anthropologist* 113.3 (2011): 478-490. Online <PDF>. Wiley Online Library. 27 Sept. 2011. <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1548-1433.2010.01355.x/pdf>>.
- Brown, Lois. Pauline Elizabeth Hopkins : Black daughter of the Revolution. University of North Carolina Press: Chapel Hill, NC, 2008.
- Buechler, Steven M. "Beyond Resource Mobilization? Emerging Trends in Social Movement Theory." *The Sociological Quarterly* 34.2 (1993): 217-235. Web. JSTOR. 18 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/4120699>>.
- "Resource Mobilization and Social Movements: A Partial Theory." *American Journal of Sociology* 82.6 (1993):. Web.
- Buechler, Steven M. "New Social Movement Theories." *The Sociological Quarterly* 36.3 (1995): 441-464. Web. JSTOR. 8 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/4120774>>.
- Butler, Judith. "Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory." *Theatre Journal* 40.4 (1988): 519-531. Web. JSTOR. 6 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3207893>>.
- Callahan, William A. "Non-Governmental Organizations, Non-Violent Action, and Post-Modern Politics in Thailand." *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia*, Vol. 10, No.

1, Post-Modernism and Southeast Asian Scholarship (1995): 90-115.

<PDF>. JSTOR. 9 Apr. 2012.

<<http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/41056904.pdf?acceptTC=true>>.

-- Cartya, Victoria and Jake Onyetta. "Protest, Cyberactivism and New Social Movements: The Reemergence of the Peace Movement Post 9/11." *Social Movement Studies: Journal of Social, Cultural and Political Protest* 5.3 (1995): 229-249. Web. 8 Apr. 2012.

<<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14742830600991586#tabModule>>.

-- Claiborn, Michele P. and Paul S. Martin. "The Third Face of Social Capital: How Membership in Voluntary Associations Improves Policy Accountability." *Political Research Quarterly* 60.6 (2007). Web. JSTOR. 24 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/4623821>>.

-- Consaluo, Mia and Susanna Paasonen, eds. Women and everyday uses of the Internet. Peter Lang Publishing, Inc.: New York, NY, 2002.

-- Coppock, Deena Haydon, and Ingrid Richter. The illusions of "post-feminism": New women, old myths. London: Taylor and Francis, 1995.

-- Crenshaw, Kimberle. "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color." *Stanford Law Review* 43.6 (1991): 1241-1299. Web. JSTOR. 26 Nov 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/1229039>>.

-- Daly, Sunny. "Young Women as Activists in Contemporary Egypt: Anxiety, Leadership, and the Next Generation." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 6.10 (2010): 59-85. Project MUSE. Online <PDF>. 24 Sept. 2011.

<http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_middle_east_womens_studies/v006/6.2.daly.pdf>.

-- Duncan, Lauren E. "Motivation for Collective Action: Group Consciousness as Mediator of Personality, Life Experiences, and Women's Rights Activism." *Political Psychology* 20.3 (1999). Web. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3792164>>.

-- Dwyer, Claire. "Contested Identities: Challenging Dominant Representations of Young British Muslim Women." Cool Places: geographies of youth cultures. London: Routledge, 1998.

-- Edelman, Marc. "Social Movements: Changing Paradigms and Forms of Politics." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30 (2001): 285- 317. Web. 24 Oct. 2011.

<<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3069218>>.

-- Einwohner, Rachel L. and Jocelyn A. Hollander and Toska Olson. "'Engendering Social Movements: Cultural Images and Movement Dynamics.'" *Gender and Society* 14.5 (2000):679-699. Web. JSTOR. 18 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/190456>>.

-- Elsadda, Hoda. "Arab Women Bloggers: The Emergence of Literary Counterpublics." *"Middle East Journal of Culture and Communication* 3.3 (2010): 312-332. Web. 24 Sept. 2011.

- Elshstain, Jean Bethke. Public man, private woman : women in social and political thought. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1981.
- Etling, Bruce and John Kelly and Robert Faris and John Palfrey. "Mapping the Arabic blogosphere: politics and dissent online." *New Media Society* 12.8 (2010): 1225-1243. Web. 4 Feb. 2012. <<http://nms.sagepub.com/content/12/8/1225.full.pdf>>.
- Ewick, Patricia and Susan S. Silbey. "Subversive Stories and Hegemonic Tales: Toward a Sociology of Narrative." *Law and Society Association*. 29.2 (1995): 197- 226. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3054010>>.
- Ewick, Patricia and Susan S. Silbey. "Narrating Social Structure: Stories of Resistance to Legal Authority." *American Journal of Sociology* 108.6 (2003). JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/378035>>.
- Foust, Christina R. Transgression as a mode of resistance. Lexington Books: Lanham, MD, 2010. [E-resource]
- Ghorashi, Halleh and Nayereh Tavakoli. "Paradoxes of transnational space and local activism: Iranians organizing across borders." *American Sociological Review* 72.3 (2006). EBSCOhost. Online <PDF>. 22 Oct. 2011. <<http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=6b041f5e-0978-4c79-8c4c-e3b15a8caca3%40sessionmgr15&vid=2&hid=9>>.
- Gamson, William A. Talking Politics. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 1992.
- Gamson, William A. The Strategy of Social Protest. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth. 2nd ed, 1990.
- Gilligan, Carol. In A Different Voice. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1993._
- Goodwin, Jeff, and James M. Jasper, eds. Rethinking Social Movements: Structure, Meaning and Emotion. Rowman & Littlefield: Lanham, MD, 2004.
- Gordon, Hava Rachel. "Gendered paths to teenage political participation: Parental power, civic mobility, and youth activism." *Gender & Society* 22.1 (2008) CSAillumna. PDF. 7 Oct. 2011. <<http://gas.sagepub.com/content/22/1/31.full.pdf+html>>.
- Gornick, Vivian. Emma Goldman: Revolution as a way of Life. Yale University Press: New Haven, CT, 2011.
- Graber, Doris A., Ed. Media power in politics, 6th ed. CQ Press: Washington, D.C., 2011.
- Guidry, John A. "The Struggle to Be Seen: Social Movements and the Public Sphere in Brazil." *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society* Vol. 16, No. 4 (2003): 493-524. Web. JSTOR. 8 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/20020183>>.

- Haas, Tani. "From "Public Journalism" to the "Public's Journalism"? Rhetoric and reality in the discourse on web logs." *Journalism Studies* Volume 6, Issue 3, *Journalism Studies* Volume 6, Issue 3 (2005): 387-296. Web. 9 Apr. 2012.
<<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14616700500132073#tabModule>>.
- Hall, Elaine J. and Marnie Salupo Rodriguez. "The Myth of Postfeminism." *Gender & Society* 17.6 (2003): pp. 878-902. Web. 17 Apr. 2012.
<<http://gas.sagepub.com/content/17/6/878.full.pdf+html>>
- Hardy, Gayle J. *American Women Civil Rights Activists: biobibliographies of 68 Leaders, 1825-1992*. McFarland and Company, Inc.: Jefferson, NC, 1993
- Holloway, John. *Change the World without Taking Power*. London: Pluto Press, 2002.
- Hooghe, Marc and Dietlind Stolle. "Good Girls Go to the Polling Booth, Bad Boys Go Everywhere" *Women & Politics* 26.3-4 (2008). Web. 8 Oct. 2011.
<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1300/J014v26n03_01>.
- Jasper, James. *The Art of Moral Protest: Culture, Biography, and Creativity in Social Movements*. University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 1997.
- Jenson, Jane. "Social movement naming practices and the political opportunity structure." Madrid : Centro de Estudios Avanzados en Ciencias Sociales, Instituto Juan March de Estudios e Investigaciones, 1998.
- Johnston, Hank ed. *Culture, Social Movements and Protest*. Ashgate: Farnham, England, 2009.
- Khamis, Sahar. "The Transformative Egyptian Media Landscape." *International Journal of Communication* 5 (2011): 1159–1177. Web. 23 Jan. 2012.
<<http://ijoc.org/ojs/index.php/ijoc/article/view/813/592>>
- Khosravi, Shahram. *Young and Defiant in Tehran*. Philadelphia: University of Philadelphia Press, 2008.
- King, Kelley M. *Call Her a Citizen : Progressive-Era Activist and Educator Anna Pennybacker*. Texas A&M University Press: College Station, TX, 2010. [E-resource]
- Kostiner, Idit. "Evaluating Legality: Toward a Cultural Approach to the Study of Law and Social Change." *Law and Society Review* 37.2 (2003). Web. 7 Oct. 2011.
<<http://www.jstor.org/stable/1555132>>.
- Lackoff, George. *Don't think of an elephant! : know your values and frame the debate : the essential guide for progressives*. Chelsea Green Pub: White River Junction, Vt., 2004.
- Leonard, Marion. "Paper Planes: traveling the New Grrrl geographies." *Cool Places*:

geographies of youth cultures. London: Routledge, 1998.

-- Lerner, Melissa Y. "Connecting the Actual with the Virtual: The Internet and Social Movement Theory in the Muslim World -- The Cases of Iran and Egypt." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* Volume 30, Issue 4 (2010): 555-574. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13602004.2010.533453>>.

-- Ling, Peter J. and Sharon Monteith. Gender and the Civil Rights Movement. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2004.

-- Loewenstein, Anthony. The Blogging Revolution. Melbourne University Press: Carlton, Victoria, 2008.

-- Lynch, Mark. "After Egypt: The Limits and Promise of Online Challenges to the Authoritarian Arab State." *Cambridge Journals: Perspectives on politics* 9.2 (2011). <PDF>. 23 Jan. 2012. <<http://www.marclynch.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/download-Lynch-article.pdf>>

-- McCann, Michael. "Law and Social Movements." *The Blackwell Companion to Law and Society*. (2004) Online <PDF>. 16 Sept. 2011. <<https://bpace.berkeley.edu/access/content/group/9ec6bbb7-2b77-4657-9f05-f193414e3d69/Lecture%20Readings/Class%20FOUR%3A%20Tuesday%2C%20September%206/McCann%2C%20Law%20and%20Social%20Movements.pdf>>.

-- McLeod, Douglas M. and Benjamin H. Detenber. "Framing Effects of Television News Coverage of Social Protest." *Journal of Communication*, 49.3 (1999): 3-23. <PDF>. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1999.tb02802.x/pdf>>.

--McLeod, Jack M., Dietram A. Scheufele and Patricia Moy. "Community, Communication, and Participation: The Role of Mass Media and Interpersonal Discussion in Local Political Participation." *Political Communication* 16.3 (1999): 315-336. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/105846099198659>>.

-- McNamee, Sara. "Youth, Gender and Video Games: power and control in the home." Cool Places: geographies of youth cultures. London: Routledge, 1998.

-- McRobbie, Angela. The aftermath of feminism: gender, culture and social change. London: SAGE Publications, 2009.

-- Merry, Sally Engel. "Resistance and the Cultural Power of Law." *Law & Society Review* 29.1 (1995). Web. JSTOR. 24 Oct. 2011. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3054052>.

-- Morris, Aldon D. "A Retrospective on the Civil Rights Movement: Political and Intellectual Landmarks." *Annual Review of Sociology* Vol. 25, (1999) (pp. 517-539). Web. JSTOR. 8 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/223515>>.

-- Passy, Florence and Marco Giugni. "Socialization, Connection, and The Structure/Agency

Gap: A Specification of The Impact of Networks on Participation in Social Movements.” *Mobilization: An International Quarterly* 6.2 (2001): 123-153. Web. JSTOR. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/685032>>.

-- Pichardo, Nelson A. “New Social Movements: A Critical Review.” *Annual Review of Sociology* 23 (1997): 411-430. <PDF> 10 Apr. 2012. <http://student.uclan.ac.uk/ahss/education_social_sciences/social_science/society_lifestyles/files/nrm15.pdf>

-- Pickerill, Jenny. “Symbolic Production, Representation, and Contested Identities.” *Information, Communication & Society* Volume 12, Issue 7 (2009): 969-993. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13691180802524469#tabModule>>.

-- Piepmeier, Alison. Girl zines: making media, doing feminism. New York: New York University Press, 2009.

-- Pole, Antoinette. ““Would Elizabeth Cady Stanton Blog? Women Bloggers, Politics, and Political Participation.” *International Journal of E-Politics* 2.2 (2011): 37-54. 14 Mar. 2012

-- Poletta, Francesca. It Was Like A Fever: storytelling in protest and politics. University of Chicago Press: Chicago, IL, 2006. [E-resource].

-- Postmes, Tom and Russell Spears and Martin Lea. “Breaching or building social boundaries? SIDE-effects of computer-mediated communication.” *Communication Research* 25.6 (1998): 689-715. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://crx.sagepub.com/content/25/6/689.full.pdf+html>>.

-- Qian, Nanxiu. “Revitalizing the Xianyuan (Worthy Ladies) Tradition: Women in the 1898 Reforms.” *Modern China* 29.4 (2003). Web. JSTOR. 16 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3181301>>

-- Ransby, Barbara. Deep In Our Hearts: Nine White Women in the Freedom Movement. The University of Georgia Press: Athens, GA, 2000.

-- Roscigno, Vincent J. and William F. Danaher. “Media and Mobilization: The Case of Radio and Southern Textile Worker Insurgency, 1929 to 1934.” *American Sociological Review* 66.1 (2001): 21-48. Web. STOR. 21 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/2657392>>.

-- Saeed, Saima. “Negotiating power: community media, democracy, and the public sphere.” *Development in Practice* Volume 19, Issue 4-5, Special Issue: Citizens' media and communication (2009): 466-478. Web. 9 Apr. 2012. <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09614520902866314>>.

-- Sakr, Naomi and Arien Mack. “Seen and starting to be heard: Women and the Arab media in a decade of change.” *Social Research*; 69.3 (2002): The Status of Women in the Developing World (2002), pp. 821-850. Web. 24 Jan. 2012.

- Sarat, Austin and Thomas R. Kearns. Law in Everyday Life. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1993.
- Scott, Alan. Ideology and the New Social Movements. Unwin Hyman: London, 1990.
- Skalli, Loubna H. "Communicating Gender in the Public Sphere: Women and Information Technologies in the MENA Region." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 2.2 (2006): 35-59. Project MUSE. Web. 23 Oct. 2011.
<<http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/jmw/summary/v002/2.2skalli.html>>.
- Smith, Norman. "Disrupting Narratives: Chinese Women Writers and the Japanese Cultural Agenda in Manchuria, 1936-1945." *Modern China* 30.3 (2004). Web. 21 Oct. 2011.
<<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3181312>>.
- Taft, Jessica K. Rebel Girls: youth activism and social change across the Americas. New York: New York University Press, 2011.
- Taylor, Verta. "'Gender and Social Movements: Gender Processes in Women's Self-Help Movements.'" *Gender and Society* 13.8 (1999): 8-33. Web. 18 Mar. 2012.
<<http://gas.sagepub.com/content/13/1/8.full.pdf+html>>.
- Thacher, David. "The Normative Case Study." *The American Journal of Sociology* 111.6 (2006).
- Tobin, Jane and Hanrie Han. "Motivated by Change: Political Activism of Young Women in the 2008 Presidential Campaign." *Women's Studies Quarterly* 38½ (2010): 115-129. Project MUSE. Web. 27 Sept. 2011.
<http://ucelinks.cdlib.org:8888/sfx_local?genre=article&issn=07321562&title=Women%27s+Studies+Quarterly&volume=38&issue=1%2f2&date=20100301&atitle=Motivated+by+Change%3a+Political+Activism+of+Young+Women+in+the+2008+Presidential+Campaign.&spage=115&sid=EBSCO:a9h&pid=>>.
- Tsutsui, Kiyoteru and Hwa Ji Shin. "Global Norms, Local Activism, and Social Movement Outcomes: Global Human Rights and Resident Koreans in Japan." *Social Problems* Vol. 55, No. 3 (2008): 391-418. Web. JSTOR. 8 Apr. 2012.
<<http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdfplus/10.1525/sp.2008.55.3.391.pdf?acceptTC=true>>.
- Wasserstrom, Jeffrey N. Popular Protest And Political Culture In Modern China. Westview Press: Boulder, CO, 1992.
- Wilson, Christopher and Alexandra Dunn. "The Arab Spring| Digital Media in the Egyptian Revolution: Descriptive Analysis from the Tahrir Data Set." *International Journal of Communication*, Vol 5 (2011): 1248-1272. Web. 6 Apr. 2012.
<<http://ijoc.org/ojs/index.php/ijoc/article/view/1180>>.

-- Wedin, Carolyn. Inheritors of the Spirit: Mary White Ovington and the Founding of the NAACP. John Wiley and Sons, Inc.: New York, NY, 1998.

-- Yadav, Stacey Philbrick. "Segmented Publics and Islamist Women in Yemen: Rethinking Space and Activism." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies*. 6.2 (2010): 1-30. Project MUSE. Online <PDF. 26 Sept. 2011. <http://mtw160150.ippl.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_middle_east_womens_studies/v006/6.2.yadav.pdf>.

-- Yan, Yunxiang. "Girl Power: Young Women and the Waning of Patriarchy in Rural North China." *Ethnology* 45.2 (2006). Web. 16 Oct. 2011. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/4617569>>.

-- Zhang, Weiwu, J. Thomas and Trent Seltzer, and Shannon L. Bichard. "The revolution will be networked: The influence of social networking sites on political attitudes and behavior." *Social Science Computer Review*. Special Issue: Symposium issue on information technology, social capital, and civic engagement 28.1 (2010). CSAillumna. Online <PDF>. 22 Oct. 2011. <<http://ssc.sagepub.com/content/28/1/75.full.pdf+html>>.